
Contact Zones

Edited by Katie Pickles and Myra Rutherdale

Contact Zones
Aboriginal and Settler Women
in Canada's Colonial Past



UBCPress · Vancouver · Toronto

© UBC Press 2005

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without prior written permission of the publisher, or, in Canada, in the case of photocopying or other reprographic copying, a licence from Access Copyright (Canadian Copyright Licensing Agency), www.accesscopyright.ca.

15 14 13 12 11 10 09 08 07 06 05 5 4 3 2 1

Printed in Canada on ancient-forest-free paper (100% post-consumer recycled) that is processed chlorine- and acid-free, with vegetable-based inks.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Contact zones : aboriginal and settler women in Canada's colonial past / edited by Katie Pickles and Myra Rutherdale.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-7748-1135-4

ISBN-10: 0-7748-1135-8

1. Indian women – Canada – Social conditions – 19th century. 2. Indian women – Canada – Social conditions – 20th century. 3. Women pioneers – Canada – Social conditions – 19th century. 4. Women pioneers – Canada – Social conditions – 20th century. 5. Indian women – Canada – History – 19th century. 6. Indian women – Canada – History – 20th century. 7. Women pioneers – Canada – History – 19th century. 8. Women pioneers – Canada – History – 20th century. I. Pickles, Katie II. Rutherdale, Myra, 1961-

E78.C2C5655 2005 305.4'0971'09034 C2005-904004-1

Canada

UBC Press gratefully acknowledges the financial support for our publishing program of the Government of Canada through the Book Publishing Industry Development Program (BPIDP), and of the Canada Council for the Arts, and the British Columbia Arts Council.

This book has been published with the help of a grant from the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences, through the Aid to Scholarly Publications Programme, using funds provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and with the help of the K.D. Srivastava Fund.

Printed and bound in Canada by Friesens
Set in Stone by Artegraphica Design Co. Ltd.
Copy editor: Audrey McClellan
Proofreader: Sarah Munro
Indexer: Heather Ebbs

UBC Press
The University of British Columbia
2029 West Mall
Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z2
604-822-5959 / Fax: 604-822-6083
www.ubcpres.ca

Contents

Illustrations / vii

Acknowledgments / ix

Introduction / 1

Katie Pickles and Myra Rutherford

Part 1: Dressing and Performing Bodies: Aboriginal Women, Imperial Eyes, and Betweenness

- 1** Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production / 17

Sherry Farrell Racette

- 2** Championing the Native: E. Pauline Johnson Rejects the Squaw / 47

Carole Gerson and Veronica Strong-Boag

- 3** Performing for "Imperial Eyes": Bernice Loft and Ethel Brant Monture, Ontario, 1930s-60s / 67

Cecilia Morgan

- 4** Spirited Subjects and Wounded Souls: Political Representations of an Im/moral Frontier / 90

Jo-Anne Fiske

Part 2: Regulating the Body: Domesticity, Sexuality, and Transgression

- 5** Metropolitan Knowledge, Colonial Practice, and Indigenous Womanhood: Missions in Nineteenth-Century British Columbia / 109

Adele Perry

- 6** Creating “Semi-Widows” and “Supernumerary Wives”: Prohibiting Polygamy in Prairie Canada’s Aboriginal Communities to 1900 / 131
Sarah A. Carter
- 7** Intimate Surveillance: Indian Affairs, Colonization, and the Regulation of Aboriginal Women’s Sexuality / 160
Robin Jarvis Brownlie
- 8** Domesticating Girls: The Sexual Regulation of Aboriginal and Working-Class Girls in Twentieth-Century Canada / 179
Joan Sangster

Part 3: Bodies in Everyday Space: Colonized and Colonizing Women in Canadian Contact Zones

- 9** Aboriginal Women on the Streets of Victoria: Rethinking Transgressive Sexuality during the Colonial Encounter / 205
Jean Barman
- 10** “She Was a Ragged Little Thing”: Missionaries, Embodiment, and Refashioning Aboriginal Womanhood in Northern Canada / 228
Myra Rutherdale
- 11** Belonging – Out of Place: Women’s Travelling Stories from the Western Edge / 246
Dianne Newell
- 12** The Old and New on Parade: Mimesis, Queen Victoria, and Carnival Queens on Victoria Day in Interwar Victoria / 272
Katie Pickles

Contributors / 293

Index / 296

Illustrations

- 29 / Embroidered mitten, ca. 1860
- 30 / Charles Napier Bell, 10 March 1871
- 33 / Watch pocket, 1859-60
- 35 / North West Mounted Police pad saddle, ca. 1880, Métis type
- 38 / Quillwork embroidered tea cozy, ca. 1913
- 52 / Pauline Johnson in Native dress, ca. 1902
- 55 / Pauline Johnson, poetess, Vancouver, 1903
- 111 / Map of colonial British Columbia
- 133 / Blackfoot women and their husband, late 1870s
- 141 / Wedding group at the Anglican mission on the Siksika Reserve, ca. 1900
- 144 / Cardston, Alberta women, ca. 1900
- 232 / Aklavik schoolgirls dressed up
- 241 / Mary Kendi, child, and nurse Prudence Hockin
- 251 / Maria Levy Septima Collis, 1842-1917
- 255 / Emily Carr in her studio
- 277 / IODE Badge

Acknowledgments

The process of writing the acknowledgments for a book represents the end of a long journey. This journey began when we first met in 1998 in Melbourne, Australia at an International Federation for Research in Women's History conference. We connected instantly. Our shared interest in women and colonization led to many long discussions over email and in person in Vancouver over the winter of 1998-99, when Katie was a visiting scholar at the University of British Columbia and Myra was teaching women's studies at Simon Fraser University. Excited about questions concerning gender, colonization, and embodiment in Canada we began work on this volume in the summer of 2000.

Conferences, study leaves, and research trips in Canada and around the world have brought contributors together to discuss the core concerns of this project. We owe a debt of gratitude to the authors of these essays who patiently supported all of our efforts to bring this volume together. They were a pleasure to work with.

In Canada, we are very fortunate to have the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, which so generously supports publishing endeavours such as this one.

We would like to thank Jean Wilson for her constant enthusiasm, and all of the staff at UBC Press for their hard work and support. The comments of the anonymous readers were also helpful. For the help with photographic reproduction and map making we would like to thank Ateffa Salihi at York University's Department of History, Elizabeth Wright of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Eric Leinberger at the University of British Columbia, Kelly-Ann Nolin at the Royal British Columbia Museum, Jeannie Hounslow at the City of Vancouver Archives, and Robin Weber at the Prince of Wales Northern Heritage Centre in Yellowknife.

Katie would like to thank the School of History at the University of Canterbury for its ongoing support of this project. Pauline Wedlake provided technical assistance. As heads of department, John Cookson, Miles Fairburn,

and Peter Hempenstall granted the research and study leave that enabled her to spend valuable time in Canada which was financially supported by funds from the University of Canterbury and a Government of Canada Faculty Research Award. The Association for Canadian Studies in Australia and New Zealand (ACSANZ) provided an important forum for the discussion of the project, in particular at the "Canada in New Zealand" regional conference held at the University of Canterbury on 1 July 2001. Family, friends, and colleagues have offered valuable advice and assistance. In particular, Melissa Kerdelmidis, Michael McCosker, Philippa Mein Smith, Ann Parsonson, and Graeme Wynn all shared their expertise.

Myra would like to thank her family, who have continued to sustain her throughout. Rob has been a dear friend and companion and her son Andrew now knows much more than he may ever want to on the theme of gender and colonization. Jean and the late Jack Rutherford have always been kind, supportive, and interested in her work. In the final stages of bringing this book together Myra was fortunate to take up a Canada Research Chair postdoctoral fellowship in Native/Newcomer relations at the University of Saskatchewan. Her year there was very rewarding. Work in Native/Newcomer history is especially supported at the University of Saskatchewan. Apart from the scholarship, she was well looked after by colleagues Whitney Lackenbauer, Bill and Marley Waiser, Lesley McBain, Keith and Teresa Carlson, and Mary and Jim Miller. The kindness, hospitality, and encouragement of Mary and Jim was deeply appreciated. Sadly, Mary died in December 2004 but her positive spirit and friendly nature will long be remembered. She was a kindred spirit. At her new academic home, York University's Department of History, Myra is particularly fortunate to have many engaged and engaging colleagues including Bettina Bradbury, Kate McPherson, Carolyn Podruchny, and Anne Rubenstein who have been especially welcoming. It is also a pleasure to acknowledge William Westfall, who was her dissertation supervisor at York, and who is now a dear colleague and friend.

In the end, this book owes much to the experiences of the Aboriginal and the settler women whose lives unfold in the following chapters.

Contact Zones

Introduction

Katie Pickles and Myra Rutherdale

Women's raced and classed bodies were a vital "contact zone" in the Canadian colonial past. During colonization, women and bodies mattered and were bound up in creating and perpetuating an often hidden, complex, contradictory, and fraught history.¹ Women occupied the spaces of colonial encounter between Aboriginals and newcomers as both colonizers and the colonized, transgressing restrictive boundaries and making history. In varied sites of encounter, Aboriginal women, white women travellers, missionaries, and settlers were all integral to the colonial project. Colonial relationships of power were expressed locally and in different times and places that were grounded in the materiality of women's day-to-day lives. By focusing on the nexus between women's bodies and colonization, this book reveals and interprets contact zones in English Canada's colonial past. It demonstrates the importance of women's history in expanding the understanding of imperialism and colonialism.

The book is divided into three thematic parts. The first part of *Contact Zones* focuses on Aboriginal women and the ways in which they contested the colonial quagmire so that they would not just survive, but also benefit from the changing circumstances of their own and their people's lives. Part 2 looks at the regulation of Aboriginal women's and girls' bodies by non-Aboriginal or Anglo-Canadian church and state authorities. The third part considers both Aboriginal and white women in publicly demarcated spaces. In each of these public encounters, preconceived ideas about whiteness and entitlement were reinforced and sometimes challenged. Throughout the collection, contributors grapple with the ongoing difficulty of writing women into history, incorporating feminist and postcolonial theory. The contributors employ a wide range of methods to make sense of their material, which ranges from personal testimonies to government records.

Contact Zones contributes to a large, diverse, and international historical literature on gender, race, and colonialism. Prominent journals have devoted special issues to research and discussion; scholars interested in gender and

race in the history of nation, empire, and colony have gathered at conferences; and edited collections and monographs have multiplied.² Anna Davin's 1978 article "Imperialism and Motherhood" initiated examination of the crucial importance of gender in imperialism.³ Subsequent work recovered and celebrated white women's presence in imperialism.⁴ But such an approach was considered problematic by those who linked gender and race and thought white women complicit in imperial projects. Clearly it was insufficient to uncritically recover and chronicle women's presence as colonizers. This realization led to recognition that some white women were in agreement with racist practices and had economically and morally benefited from their beliefs.⁵ As Anne McClintock explains in *Imperial Leather: Gender, Race and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest*, white women were not "the hapless onlookers of empire, but were ambiguously complicit both as colonisers and colonized, privileged and restricted, acted upon and acting."⁶ At the same time as women's historians were questioning the invisibility of women of colour, they were also unpacking the term "white" in order to, as Vron Ware explains, "get away from the assumption that to be White is to be normal, while to be not-White is to occupy a racial category with all its attendant meanings."⁷ This new awareness of "whiteness" as a racialized term further complicated questions of privilege and colonial citizenship. For example, in Canada white women were both powerful and powerless. Their power rested in their whiteness, but they were constrained by patriarchy.

The purpose of this book is to locate Canadian women's history within colonial and imperial systems. To do so, the contributors build upon a large and varied body of work dealing with themes in Canadian women's history such as voluntary work, health, welfare, children, and education.⁸ They also add to the historiography on women's public and private lives, maternal and equal rights feminism, and labour history.

In order to explore the social construction of femininity and masculinity, with "gender as a category of analysis," women's history has moved well beyond fixed, biologically grounded sex categories.⁹ As the editors of *Gendered Pasts: Historical Essays on Femininity and Masculinity in Canada* admonished fellow scholars, it is important to remember that "however diverse the approach or conclusions of gender history, it is imperative that historians not lose sight of the power relations that constitute, and are constituted by, gender."¹⁰ In short, while gendered identities can be and often are fluid, they are also always full of power. Colonial relations were particularly loaded with racialized and fluid power dynamics. Racial relations and constructions therefore form the centre of this book. While Canadian women's historians have actively revealed the histories of immigrant women and women of colour,¹¹ most of this book focuses on Aboriginal women, with Anglo-Canadian women also prominent.

Specifically, *Contact Zones* builds upon the work of Canadian scholars who have examined gender, empire, and contact zones. Mary-Ellen Kelm's study of Aboriginal health and healing in British Columbia during the first half of the twentieth century, for example, is concerned with the multiple implications of "colonizing bodies."¹² Karen Dubinsky, in her work on honeymooning and tourism at Niagara Falls, explores the connections between travel and race/ethnicity. Dubinsky identifies the fascination with which tourists gazed at and commented on North American Aboriginals and the ways they expected them to perform Indianness.¹³ Gillian Whitlock's interpretation of the autobiographical writings of Susanna Moodie resituates the complex position of settler subjects.¹⁴ There is now a large literature on topics as diverse as heroines and history, Anglican missionary women, imperial women, and captivity narratives.¹⁵ From a range of perspectives, the contributors in this book pursue themes such as marriage, the power of state and church institutions, men's control over women's bodies, women's agency, and material culture.

Women's bodies have always been at the heart of feminism. While some scholars may credit social theorists with recognizing the importance of concepts of "embodiment," feminists have always been keenly aware of women's struggle to control their own bodies.¹⁶ As Ruth Roach Pierson claims, "Women in the second half of the twentieth century have challenged the disembodiment implied by the airy Cartesian stance as sexist and racist." According to Pierson, the dichotomy between the mind and the body proposed by Descartes does not hold true for women: "Proof of our embodiment ... confronts us at every turn. But so does proof of our lack of control over that embodiment, and that is what women have sought to change."¹⁷ By placing bodies at the centre of this text, we have revealed a new way of understanding the ways that colonial practices are carried out in day-to-day lived experiences in colonial contexts.

By engaging critically with the ideas of male social theorists, while attending to Audre Lorde's warning that "the master's tools will never dismantle the master's house,"¹⁸ we can see how the scaffolding for much feminist thinking on the body has engaged with Foucault and Derrida.¹⁹ Foucault's focus on the way that bodies respond to various regimes of domination, discipline, and normalization – or as he would have it, "the micro-practices of everyday life" – resituated our understanding of knowledge/power relations and moved the body from the margins to the centre of social scientific research.²⁰ In general, feminist theorists have paid much attention to how knowledge/power is embodied.²¹ However, as Donna Haraway reminds us, attention to bodies does not mean just the individual body. Collective experience must also be analyzed.²² *Contact Zones* considers individual bodily experiences as well as the collective project so wonderfully rendered by Mary-Ellen Kelm's notion of "colonizing bodies."

In this book, feminist historical and theoretical literatures intersect with the literature on “contact zones,” a term coined by Mary Louise Pratt in *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. Pratt identified the “contact zone” as “the space of colonial encounters, the space in which peoples geographically and historically separated come into contact with each other and establish ongoing relations, usually involving conditions of coercion, radical inequality, and intractable conflict.”²³ To some extent, Pratt extended the concept of the frontier. While an earlier idea of frontier was seen from the perspective of European expansion, Pratt’s concept of “contact zone” emphasized “copresence, interaction, interlocking understandings and practices, often within radically asymmetrical relations of power.”²⁴

Imperial Eyes, together with other work, has moved us beyond linear narratives of progress, allowing for the disruption of the position of Aboriginal peoples as “Other,” who at best might offer resistance to colonial powers. Australian historian Lynette Russell has noted that although the term is widely used throughout the historiography of Native/newcomer relations, “resistance” represents a very restricted category. Russell explains in her introduction to *Colonial Frontiers* that “cross-cultural encounters produce boundaries and frontiers. These are spaces both physical and intellectual, which are never neutrally positioned, but are assertive, contested, and dialogic. Boundaries and frontiers are sometimes negotiated, sometimes violent and often are structured by convention and protocol that are not immediately obvious to those standing on either one side or the other.”²⁵ Similarly, imperial historian John MacKenzie argues for the plural and complex consideration of frontiers that are “hidden as well as visible, mentally and psychically constructed as well as geographically expressed and surveyed.”²⁶

Focusing on contact zones necessitates the consideration of metropolitan power and the significance of empires.²⁷ While Mary Louise Pratt questions cores and peripheries, Antoinette Burton suggests that just as colonies were sites of contact, so too was the United Kingdom.²⁸ In her introduction to *Gender, Sexuality and Colonial Modernities*, Burton acknowledges that “like colonial modernities themselves, the latest work on gender and empire must be considered as unfinished and therefore as open to re-interpretation as any other material practice or discursive regime.”²⁹ Reflecting such sentiments, there is now a growing interest in the experiences of Indian, Canadian, and Australian women in the United Kingdom, with their position in the imperial metropolis and discourses of modernity providing key themes.³⁰

Canada was colonized by two often conflicting imperial powers. Because of the divergent scholarship on English and French Canada, contributors to this book are concerned solely with British imperialism in constructing the colonial past. *Contact Zones* includes the regions of Pacific, western, and central Canada. There is still much to be learned about Atlantic Canada,

and new directions are being forged by those interested in Quebec's colonial past.³¹ Renewed interest in imperialism has forced Canadians in general, and all historians of women in Canada, to ask to what extent Canada was shaped by empire. How much of an influence was the British empire or British Canada? In light of a renewed consciousness about "white settler societies," Phillip Buckner has asked, "Whatever happened to the British Empire?" The question suggests that recent Canadian historians have downplayed the significance of the imperial experience.³²

Dressing and Performing Bodies: Aboriginal Women, Imperial Eyes, and Betweenness

In 1980 Sylvia Van Kirk argued in *Many Tender Ties* that women played a central role in fur-trade society. Van Kirk emphasized the complexities of an "unusual society" in which many Aboriginal women were vital and active in the operation and success of the fur trade. Van Kirk also moved beyond viewing either Aboriginal or white women as passive victims and explored the "women in between" – Aboriginal women who married white men, and the white women who were threatened by these marriages.³³ With her themes of acculturation, contact zones, the politics of white womanhood, and the division between the colonized and the colonizer, Van Kirk was at the forefront of scholarship relevant to this volume.

The first part of *Contact Zones* shows that, far from being invisible, without agency or voice, Aboriginal women in Canada expressed their responses to colonization in ways that centred on the body, from dress to performativity. Informed by the work of Judith Butler, these authors take performance to mean the ways in which aboriginality was both discursively made and politically situated in the materiality of women's lives. Clothing, gesture, speech acts, and stage performances all tended to reconfigure relations between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal in the Canadian contact zone. Often caught between two worlds, Aboriginal women bravely and creatively negotiated identity.

In "Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production," Sherry Farrell Racette alters how we interpret the day-to-day experiences of Métis women, many of whom used traditional artistic skills for economic gain by "dressing the West." She describes the extent to which fur traders and settlers relied on Métis women and argues that Métis and "half-breed" women were motivated to participate in the shifting economy and provide clothing for the various groups of newcomers who occupied the land. These women were crucial cultural brokers who ensured the comfort and survival of the American army, the North West Mounted Police, cowboys, and Aboriginals. Clothing served as a mediator, giving Métis women access to the economy. The bodies of newcomer men served as a stage upon which Métis women could perform their brilliant acts of artistry.

Dress is also a theme in Carole Gerson and Veronica Strong-Boag's "Championing the Native: E. Pauline Johnson Rejects the Squaw." Being of mixed ancestry (Iroquois and European), Johnson traversed two worlds. As Gerson and Strong-Boag note, she was often "viewed as a test of the outcome of racial mixing in border spaces." Johnson's power came partly because she could move between Aboriginal and newcomer worlds. Skeptical about the common view of Aboriginal women as victims, Gerson and Strong-Boag argue that Johnson "portrayed Native women as not only the equals of white women, but at times their superiors." They see Johnson herself as a woman who could negotiate a new understanding and garner from the newcomer society a level of respect for her own people, and for the women in her nation in particular. Gerson and Strong-Boag point out how self-conscious and deliberate Johnson was about creating her own identity. "Her success as a star of stage and salon depended in large part, as with other actresses of her day such as Sarah Bernhardt, on the vivid and implicitly erotic presence of comely female flesh. Johnson always paid close attention to costume and movement and understood full well that her attractive appearance was the source of much of her appeal."

In "Performing for 'Imperial Eyes': Bernice Loft and Ethel Brant Monture, Ontario, 1930s-60s," Cecilia Morgan provides a very different example of how two Native women disturbed racially based categorization and negotiated equitable status for Aboriginal Canadians through improved educational opportunities and living conditions. Their public appearances at historical society meetings, Canadian Clubs, Pauline Johnson's poetry readings, and harvest festivals often forced them into "playing Indian." Both were expected to present a "refined" and "authentic" Aboriginal womanhood, yet they most often delighted in moving beyond these images. "Rather than being fascinated by feathers and fringes, though," argues Morgan, "non-Native observers could be pleasantly surprised at the spectacle of an 'Indian' woman who wore a two-piece suit, nylon stockings, heels, and a carefully coiffed Western-style hairdo." Newspaper reporters categorized these women as somehow exotic, yet at the same time they were "proof of the efficacy of assimilationist strategies." Morgan not only demonstrates how Monture and Loft destabilized racial categories, but her work also reminds us of a major historiographical gap. The history of Native/newcomer relations in Ontario – and all of Canada – has often neglected individuals' stories, focusing instead on institutions and detrimental public policy.

In "Spirited Subjects and Wounded Souls: Political Representations of an Im/moral Frontier," Jo-Anne Fiske looks at the residential school, considering the impact of residential schooling upon generations of Aboriginal women and their families, and argues that "no true story of the residential school should be alleged; neither should we seek some fair balance of good and evil, of morality and immorality on a colonial frontier. Rather, we should

seek to understand the postcolonial representations of the past and ask what they might offer to those who seek remedy for the harm they endured." She examines assumptions about relations between nuns and young girls in residential schools, inviting readers to reconsider the colonial encounter "as a clash of moral strangers and posit the im/moral frontier as a struggle to define the moral universe and to enforce others to abide within its *nomos* through control of material and symbolic resources." Fiske offers a unique perspective by arguing for lost motherhood as an area of mutuality between nuns and their wards. While children and nuns met as strangers, in the contact zone they shared a common link – they had each sacrificed their mothers. Fiske suggests that since nuns gave up their families and friendships to live in poverty, chastity, and obedience, they believed it was not asking too much of Aboriginal children that they should do the same. But survivors of the schools could not necessarily understand this sacrifice and have tried to recover from "spirit wounding," the trauma and harshness caused by the residential school experience and the hypocrisy they were exposed to.

Regulating the Body: Domesticity, Sexuality, and Transgression

The second part of *Contact Zones* asserts the importance of domesticity and family in the colonial process. A central theme here is sexuality, particularly the idea of Aboriginal women as sexually transgressive and therefore needing to be controlled. Domesticity and proper womanly behaviour were critical components in colonial relations.³⁴ Agents of church and state attempted to enact colonization by controlling and regulating women's bodies. The force with which imperial policy was applied to Aboriginal women was particularly harsh given the conditions and changes for women in Anglo-Canadian society. As these chapters show, Aboriginal women's transgressions from the norms of health, family, and sexuality were subject to harsh discipline. Colonial expansion was predicated in part on ideas about inferior and superior racial types, and European Canadians were generally considered racially superior to Aboriginal peoples.

In "Metropolitan Knowledge, Colonial Practice, and Indigenous Womanhood: Missions in Nineteenth-Century British Columbia," Adele Perry examines behavioural prescriptions as expressed by male missionaries in British Columbia between the 1840s and 1890s. She argues that many domestic ideals were like missionary baggage, transferred and transposed in new environments. But "metropolitan knowledge" was rarely adopted by Aboriginal women in British Columbia. Perry talks about "Christian conjugality," by which she means "lifelong, domestic, heterosexual unions sanctioned by colonial law and [the] Christian church." This discourse, she argues, was "a staple of the missionary program throughout nineteenth-century British Columbia." Mixed-race marriages were particularly worrisome to Christian

missionaries, but more offensive were marriages not sanctioned by the church. And while church weddings were performed and “proper womanhood” enforced, missionaries were most concerned to keep Aboriginal women in a state of working-class dependence. They wanted them to work but not become too independent. “Waged work gave Aboriginal women the dangerous independence that went with having ready cash income and the means to support themselves outside of male authority and the family.”

Similarly, in “Creating ‘Semi-Widows’ and ‘Supernumerary Wives’: Prohibiting Polygamy in Prairie Canada’s Aboriginal Communities to 1900,” Sarah A. Carter examines the Department of Indian Affairs’ (DIA) imposition of Western discourses of sexuality, polygamy, and morality on prairie Aboriginal communities from 1870 to 1900. Placing polygamy in a North American and international context, she argues that “legal, political, and missionary authorities shared the view that a particular marriage model – of lifelong monogamy in the tradition of the Christian religion and English common law – symbolized the proper differences between the sexes and set the foundation for the way both sexes were to behave.” Carter suggests that DIA officials hoped that polygamy would die out. They believed that they were “introducing a superior civilization, at the core of which were the ‘proper’ gender identities embedded in the cherished marriage model.” Arguing that the interventions caused “turmoil and rupture,” Carter points out that one of the outcomes of enforced monogamy and prohibition of polygamy, divorce, and remarriage (except in the event of the death of a spouse) was the appearance of a sector of society that was new to Plains people: impoverished single women, often mothers.

In exploring “Intimate Surveillance: Indian Affairs, Colonization, and the Regulation of Aboriginal Women’s Sexuality” in Ontario during the first half of the twentieth century, Robin Jarvis Brownlie presents a compelling case to show the power individual Indian agents could have in the moral regulation and control of Aboriginal women’s lives. Brownlie points out that not all agents behaved the same way, but they could each wield both the carrot and the stick: “An obvious mode of colonialism in DIA practice and discourse lay in agents’ assumption of the right to regulate Aboriginal women’s sexuality and enforce obedience to Euro-Canadian models of correct gender expression. Indian agents had a unique ability to enforce these codes against women, especially through the use of financial control.” For behaviour deemed incorrect, DIA agents could hold back treaty payments, take away children, and, especially painful during the Depression, refuse to grant relief. The DIA viewed with suspicion those who dared to resist. A familiar tactic used by DIA agents was to send children to residential schools. As well, they viewed mixed-race marriages favourably, as they fit with the DIA’s objective of assimilation.

Joan Sangster's "Domesticating Girls: The Sexual Regulation of Aboriginal and Working-Class Girls in Twentieth-Century Canada" considers race and class in the Ontario Training School for Girls (OTSG), which opened in 1933. By then, training schools were well-established as a means of reforming the white working class and underclass. For Aboriginal Canadians, this was a time of increasing dependence on the state, the loss of self-sufficiency, and the beginning of a shift to the cities. As well as being subject to Indian agents' power to arrest, judge, and incarcerate, girls were trained as domestic workers in the belief that "honest labour was ... preventative and formative." Sangster's work is a reminder of the importance of interrogating class and capitalism within the matrix of colonial relations. She argues that "it is thus difficult to isolate one rationale for sexual regulation that trumps all others, because colonialism, gender, and class were closely intertwined, though they sometimes worked themselves out in contradictory ways." Like other contributors, Sangster finds that working-class families were also swept up in "a common project of regeneration, the goal of which was to create 'heteronorms' characterized by marriage and monogamy, male breadwinning/female domesticity, and premarital female sexual purity."

Bodies in Everyday Space: Colonized and Colonizing Women in Canadian Contact Zones

The geography of women's bodies in various Canadian temporal and spatial contact zones is the central theme of the third part of *Contact Zones*. The creation of civic, national, and imperial identity is explored within the context of developing ideas on Canadian mythmaking and national identity.³⁵ As Kathy Davis reminds us, "women's bodies have historically been used as a metaphor for nation – as, for example, Delacroix's famous rendition of Marianne as a bare-breasted, flag-bearing heroine, leading the French nation into battle."³⁶ In nationalist propaganda, white women have represented freedom and liberty, yet at the same time there is the recognition that women have not shared in the same freedom and liberty as men, and that not all women have shared power equally either. These are some contradictions played out in the chapters in this part, which show that danger, death, or, at the very least, reprimand was never far away for those who transgressed perceived norms.

In her examination of "Aboriginal Women on the Streets of Victoria: Rethinking Transgressive Sexuality during the Colonial Encounter," Jean Barman argues that the women in her study were not passive victims of colonization, but rather that racialized perceptions and the concomitant limited opportunities made it difficult for them to flourish in the local economy. The streets of nineteenth-century Victoria were a contact zone

where a woman was defined as either “prostitute or crone.” Barman tries to “understand what newcomers saw, why they saw what they saw, and what were the consequences for Aboriginal women.” Aboriginal women’s bodies were portrayed as sexually transgressive, and their claims to social spaces on streets, in dance halls, and even in their own homes were often greeted suspiciously. According to Barman, “all behaviour unlike that of women whence newcomers came was equated with prostitution, with a willingness to provide sexual favours if remunerated.” As Perry notes and Barman reiterates, financially independent Songhees, Tsimshian, Haida, and other Aboriginal women “were almost inherently suspect at a time when females were expected to live visibly subservient to their fathers, husbands, or sons.” Barman presents a classic case of a Euro-American double standard being introduced into the contact zone of late-nineteenth-century Victoria.

Myra Rutherford’s “‘She Was a Ragged Little Thing’: Missionaries, Embodiment, and Refashioning Aboriginal Womanhood in Northern Canada” examines how white Anglican missionaries in northern British Columbia, the Yukon, and the Northwest Territories wrote about Aboriginal women and children between 1870 and 1940. Health, hygiene, and sexuality were at the core of the mission program and were just as important as biblical scripture and religious training. Rutherford focuses on contrasting images of clothing and appearance, and shows that while missionary women wanted to impose their clothing tastes on Aboriginal women, they also relied heavily on Aboriginal women to help them procure winter necessities. Aboriginal bodies were “cleaned, clothed, and medicated” in an effort to exact change and conformity. Clothing and comportment served as “markers of ‘civilization’” – even representing conversion to Christianity. Rutherford concludes that “it was often a question of the visibility of the body over the invisibility of the spirit.” Missionaries were pleased to send mission newspapers photographs of Aboriginals who looked cleaned up and “civilized,” as these were visible indicators of their success for the outside world. But these too may have been performed identities rather than fixed categories of conversion.

In “Belonging – Out of Place: Women’s Travelling Stories from the Western Edge,” Dianne Newell studies the literal “appearance” of colonizing white women on the margins of empire. She considers three white women travelers and their “belonging out of place” in the British Columbia coastal contact zone. She asks: “How did they position themselves in the environment (the point of view), acknowledge boundaries, and project a voice?” To answer these questions, Newell examines the published travel narrative of an 1890 steamboat excursion through the Inside Passage by well-connected New Yorker Mrs. Maria Septima Collis; the autobiographical story (based on her attempts in the late 1920s to “word” her North Coast field experiences as a painter) by British Columbia artist-writer Emily Carr; and the

local coverage of the 1926 murder of Miss Loretta Chisholm, a young, single schoolteacher, near a northern salmon-canning centre. Newell sees the canneries as contradictory sites, “both at home (belonged) and out of place, not unlike the travelling women whose stories” she explores, and she finds that clothing and body language were read as markers of morality. While Chisholm was in many ways typical of her 1920s generation and was described as “a real lady,” she was the one who was “out of place” in the BC coastal contact zone, not the young Aboriginal man accused of her murder. While Maria Collis was an aloof traveller, Chisholm settled, worked, and lived in the contact zone, and as a result she suffered grievous bodily harm.

In “The Old and New on Parade: Mimesis, Queen Victoria, and Carnival Queens on Victoria Day in Interwar Victoria,” Katie Pickles examines patriotic celebrations in which Anglo-Canadian settler women were active in constructing colonial identity. While the celebrations included British and “oriental” symbols, in the patriotic display of Anglo-Canadian identity there was room for only assimilated Aboriginal Canadians. As Pickles shows, colonizing women could exert considerable influence on Anglo-Canadian identity. She focuses on the performance and activities of the Imperial Order Daughters of the Empire (IODE), dressing as, and keeping alive the memory of, the ultimate female imperialist role model, Queen Victoria. An older generation of female imperialists dressed as the Queen herself, while contemporary young women appeared as carnival queens, embodying civic, national, and imperial pride. Their symbolic crowning on the steps of the provincial parliament saw men with real power bowing down to glamorous young white women who pretended to be queens. Settler women’s part in colonization was far removed from the experiences of Aboriginal women. Ending the collection with a chapter on settler women’s power and whiteness is redolent of the way in which spaces for negotiating sexuality, race, gender, and class were gradually circumscribed by an increasingly harsh and pervasive white, elite, colonial system.

Contact Zones sets out to explore Canadian history in new ways. The history of colonization is a tense and difficult area to write about, but there are many vital and important stories, especially those of women, that need to be told. The contributors to *Contact Zones* resist homogenizing colonial experiences, instead offering diverse perspectives. Aboriginal and settler women, the state and society are all present and marshalled together around colonial themes. The material spans episodes that occurred in a variety of places and time periods, ranging from the late-nineteenth-century streets of Victoria to Ontario public gatherings, prairie homes, and mid-twentieth-century northern communities. Often outside the mainstream of Canadian historiography, the women’s experiences uncovered in this volume serve as a potent reminder of the implications of colonization.

Notes

- 1 The ideas and phrasing are adapted from Judith Butler, *Bodies that Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex"* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993). See Fiona Webster, "Do Bodies Matter? Sex, Gender and Politics," *Australian Feminist Studies* 17, 38 (2002): 191-205.
- 2 For example see *Women's Studies International Forum* 21, 3 (1998), a special issue on women, imperialism, and identity; "Feminisms and Internationalism," *Gender and History* 10, 3 (1998); "Reconstructing Femininities: Colonial Intersections of Gender, Race, Religion and Class," *Feminist Review* 65 (Summer 2000); *Canadian Woman Studies* 20, 2 (2000), a special issue on national identity and gender politics. Ruth Roach Pierson and Nupur Chaudhuri, eds., with the assistance of Beth McAuley, *Nation, Empire, Colony: Historicizing Gender and Race* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1998) is a selection of papers from the 1995 International Federation for Research in Women's History conference in Montreal. For edited collections see Tony Ballantyne and Antoinette Burton, eds., *Bodies in Contact: Rethinking Colonial Encounters in World History* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005); Antoinette Burton, ed., *Gender, Sexuality and Colonial Modernities* (London: Routledge, 1999); Clare Midgley, ed., *Gender and Imperialism* (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 1998); Julia Clancy-Smith and Frances Gouda, eds., *Domesticating the Empire: Race, Gender and Family Life in French and Dutch Colonialism* (Charlottesville, VA, and London: University of Virginia Press, 1998); and Nupur Chaudhuri and Margaret Strobel, eds., *Western Women and Imperialism: Complicity and Resistance* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1992).
- 3 Anna Davin, "Imperialism and Motherhood," *History Workshop Journal* 5 (Spring 1978): 9-66.
- 4 See Joanna Trollope, *Britannia's Daughters: Women of the British Empire* (London: Cresset, 1983); Claudia Knapman, *White Women in Fiji, 1835-1930: The Ruin of Empire?* (Sydney: Allen and Unwin, 1986); and Helen Callaway, *Gender, Culture and Empire: European Women in Colonial Nigeria* (Basingstoke, UK: Macmillan, 1987).
- 5 Margaret Strobel, *European Women and the Second British Empire* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1991), xi.
- 6 Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 6.
- 7 Vron Ware, *Beyond the Pale: White Women, Racism and History* (London: Verso, 1992), 18. See also Ruth Frankenberg, *White Women, Race Matters: The Social Construction of Whiteness* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995).
- 8 See Kathryn McPherson, Cecilia Morgan, and Nancy M. Forestell, eds., *Gendered Pasts: Historical Essays in Femininity and Masculinity in Canada* (Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press, 1999); Franca Iacovetta and Wendy Mitchinson, eds., *On the Case: Explorations in Social History* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1998); Alison Prentice, Paula Bourne, Gail Cuthbert-Brandt, Beth Light, Wendy Mitchinson, and Naomi Black, *Canadian Women: A History* (Toronto: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1986); Joy Parr and Mark Rosenfeld, eds., *Gender and History in Canada* (Mississauga, ON: Copp Clark, 1996); Franca Iacovetta and Mariana Valverde, eds., *Gender Conflicts: New Essays in Women's History* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992); The Clio Collective, *Quebec Women: A History* (Toronto: The Women's Press, 1987); Alison Prentice and Susan Mann Trofimenkoff, eds., *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History*, vol. 2 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985); Linda Kealey, ed., *A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880s-1920s* (Toronto: The Women's Press, 1979); and Alison Prentice and Susan Mann Trofimenkoff, eds., *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1977).
- 9 Joan Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988); Catherine Hall, *White, Male and Middle Class: Explorations in Feminism and History* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992).
- 10 McPherson, Morgan, and Forestell, *Gendered Pasts*, 11.
- 11 Jean Burnet, ed., *Looking into My Sister's Eyes: An Exploration in Women's History* (Toronto: Multicultural History Society of Toronto, 1986); Varpu Lindstrom, *Defiant Sisters: A Social History of Finnish Immigrant Women in Canada* (Toronto: Multicultural Historical Society of

- Ontario, 1988); Franca Iacovetta, *Such Hardworking People: Italian Immigrants in Postwar Toronto* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992); Peggy Bistrow and Afua Cooper, *"We're Rooted Here and They Can't Pull Us Up": Essays in African Canadian Women's History* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994); Himani Bannerji, ed., *Returning the Gaze: Essays on Racism, Feminism and Politics* (Toronto: Sister Vision Press, 1993); Sherene Razack, *Looking White People in the Face: Gender, Race, and Culture in Courtrooms and Classrooms* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1998).
- 12 Mary-Ellen Kelm, *Colonizing Bodies: Aboriginal Health and Healing in British Columbia, 1900-50* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998).
 - 13 Karen Dubinsky, *The Second Greatest Disappointment: Honeymooning and Tourism at Niagara Falls* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1999), 55-83.
 - 14 Gillian Whitlock, *The Intimate Empire: Reading Women's Autobiography* (London and New York: Cassell, 2000), 38-65.
 - 15 Karen Dubinsky, "Vacations in the 'Contact Zone': Race, Gender, and the Traveler at Niagara Falls," in *Nation, Empire, Colony* (see note 2), 251-69; Colin M. Coates and Cecilia Morgan, *Heroines and History: Representations of Madeleine de Verchères and Laura Secord* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002); Myra Rutherdale, *Women and the White Man's God: Gender and Race in the Canadian Mission Field* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2002); Katie Pickles, *Female Imperialism and National Identity: Imperial Order Daughters of the Empire (IODE)* (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2002); Adele Perry, *On the Edge of Empire: Gender, Race, and the Making of British Columbia, 1849-1871* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001); Sarah Carter, *Capturing Women: The Manipulation of Cultural Imagery in Canada's Prairie West* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997).
 - 16 On feminist theories of embodiment see Butler, *Bodies That Matter*; Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (London and New York: Routledge, 1999); Elizabeth Grosz, *Space, Time and Perversion* (London and New York: Routledge, 1995); and Elspeth Probyn, *Carnal Appetites: Foodsexidentities* (London and New York: Routledge, 2000).
 - 17 Ruth Roach Pierson, Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Paula Bourne, and Philinda Masters, *Canadian Women's Issues: Twenty-Five Years of Women's Activism in English Canada* (Toronto: Lorimer, 1993), 98.
 - 18 Audre Lorde, "The Master's Tools Will Never Dismantle the Master's House," in C. Moraga and G. Anzaldúa, *This Bridge Called My Back* (New York: Kitchen Table, Women of Color Press, 1981), 98-101.
 - 19 For feminist postcolonial theorizing on bodies that engages with Lévi-Strauss, Fanon, and Derrida, see Radhika Mohanram, *Black Body: Women, Colonialism, and Space* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999). See also Michel Foucault's books *Discipline and Punish* (New York: Vintage, 1979) and *The History of Sexuality, Volume 1: An Introduction* (New York: Vintage, 1980).
 - 20 Kathy Davis, "Embodiment Theory: Beyond Modernist and Postmodernist Readings of the Body," in *Embodied Practices: Feminist Perspectives on the Body*, ed. Kathy Davis, 1-7 (London: Sage, 1997), 7.
 - 21 Nancy Duncan, ed., *Body Space: Destabilizing Geographies of Gender and Sexuality* (London and New York: Routledge, 1996); Susan Bordo, *Unbearable Weight: Feminism, Western Culture and the Body* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993).
 - 22 Donna Haraway, *Modest_Witness@Second_Millennium.FemaleMan_Meets_OncoMouse: Feminism and Technoscience* (London and New York: Routledge, 1997); Donna Haraway, *Simians, Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature* (London and New York: Routledge, 1991).
 - 23 Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992), 6.
 - 24 Ibid.
 - 25 Lynette Russell, ed., "Introduction," in *Colonial Frontiers: Indigenous-European Encounters in Settler Societies*, 1-15 (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2001).
 - 26 John MacKenzie, "General Editor's Introduction" in Russell, *Colonial Frontiers*, xi-xii, at xi.
 - 27 See Ann Laura Stoler's influential work on how colonized bodies were shaped by the sexual policies of colonial states. Stoler extended Foucault's examination of the regulatory discourses of sexuality to race. Her work also allows Foucauldian ideas to be applied

- to sexuality and colonization. Ann Laura Stoler, *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995); Ann Laura Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002). See also Mona Gleason, "Embodied Negotiations: Children's Bodies and Historical Change in Canada, 1930 to 1960," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 34, 1 (1999): 112-38; and June Hannam and Katherine Holden, "Heartland and Periphery: Local, National and Global Perspectives on Women's History," *Women's History Review* 11, 3 (2002): 341-49.
- 28 Antoinette Burton, *At the Heart of the Empire: Indians and the Colonial Encounter in Late-Victorian Britain* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).
- 29 Burton, *Gender, Sexuality and Colonial Modernities*, 13.
- 30 Burton, *At the Heart of the Empire*; Cecilia Morgan, "Creating Transatlantic Worlds? Upper Canadian Aboriginal Peoples in Britain, 1830s-1870s" (paper presented to the Canadian Historical Association, 2003); and Angela Woollacott, *To Try Her Fortune in London: Australian Women, Colonialism and Modernity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).
- 31 For some examples in English see Colin Coates, *The Metamorphoses of Landscape and Community in Early Quebec* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000); Coates and Morgan, *Heroines and History*; Carolyn Podruchny, "Festivities, Fortitude and Fraternalism: Fur Trade, Masculinity and The Beaver Club, 1785-1827," in *New Faces in the Fur Trade: Selected Papers of the Seventh North American Fur Trade Conference*, ed. William Wicken, Jo-Anne Fiske, and Susan Sleeper-Smith, 31-52 (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1998); Carolyn Podruchny, "Baptizing Novices: Ritual Moments among French Canadian Voyageurs in the Montreal Fur Trade, 1780-1821," *Canadian Historical Review* 83, 2 (June 2002): 165-95.
- 32 Phillip Buckner, "Whatever Happened to the British Empire?" *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association* 4 (1994): 3-32; Phillip Buckner, ed., *Canada and the End of Empire* (Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press, 2005).
- 33 Sylvia Van Kirk, *Many Tender Ties: Women in Fur-Trade Society in Western Canada, 1670-1870* (Winnipeg: Watson and Dwyer, 1980).
- 34 Margaret Jolly, "Colonizing Women: The Maternal Body and Empire," in *Feminism and the Politics of Difference*, ed. Sneja Gunew and Anna Yeatman, 103-27 (St. Leonard's, Australia: Allen and Unwin, 1993); and Kalpana Ram and Margaret Jolly, *Maternities and Modernities: Colonial and Postcolonial Experiences in Asia and the Pacific* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- 35 See Himani Bannerji, Shahrzad Mojab, and Judith Whitehead, eds., *Of Property and Propriety: The Role of Gender and Class in Imperialism and Nationalism* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001); Michael Dawson, *The Mountie from Dime Novel to Disney* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1998); Daniel Francis, *National Dreams: Myth, Memory, and Canadian History* (Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp Press, 1997); Veronica Strong-Boag, Sherrill Grace, Abigail Eisenberg, and Joan Anderson, *Painting the Maple: Essays on Race, Gender, and the Construction of Canada* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1997); and Andrew Parker, Mary Russo, Doris Summer, and Patricia Yaeger, eds., *Nationalisms and Sexualities* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992).
- 36 Kathy Davis, "Embody-ing Theory," 7.