Negotiating Identities in 19th- and 20th-Century Montreal
Edited by Bettina Bradbury and Tamara Myers

Negotiating Identities in 19th- and 20th-Century Montreal

BY THE MONTREAL HISTORY GROUP
To Andrée Lévesque, long-time mentor and friend
Contents

Illustrations / ix
Acknowledgments / xi

1 Introduction: Negotiating Identities in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Montreal / 1
Bettina Bradbury and Tamara Myers

Part 1: Homes and Homelessness

2 Bonds of Friendship, Kinship, and Community: Gender, Homelessness, and Mutual Aid in Early-Nineteenth-Century Montreal / 25
Mary Anne Poutanen

3 Saving the Union’s Jack: The Montreal Sailors’ Institute and the Homeless Sailor, 1862-98 / 49
Darcy Ingram

4 Keeping Men Out of “Public or Semi-Public” Places: The Montreal Day Shelter for Unemployed Men, 1931-34 / 77
Anna Shea and Suzanne Morton

Part 2: Death, Burial, and Widowhood

5 Death, Burial, and Protestant Identity in an Elite Family: The Montreal McCords / 101
Brian Young

6 Widows Negotiate the Law: The First Year of Widowhood in Early-Nineteenth-Century Montreal / 120
Bettina Bradbury
Part 3: Youth, Institutions, and Identities

7 The Ideal Education to Construct an Ideal World: The Dunham Ladies’ College and the Anglican Elite of the Montreal Diocese, 1860-1913 / 149
   Marie-Ève Harbec, translated by Yvonne Klein

8 On Probation: The Rise and Fall of Jewish Women’s Antidelinquency Work in Interwar Montreal / 175
   Tamara Myers

9 From Tomorrow’s Elite to Young Intellectual Workers: The Search for Identity among Montreal University Students, 1900-58 / 202
   Karine Hébert, translated by Steven Watt

Part 4: Selling and Consumption

10 “Behind the Store”: Montreal Shopkeeping Families between the Wars / 235
   Sylvie Taschereau, translated by Yvonne Klein

11 A Ritual Transformed: Women Smokers in Montreal, 1888-1950 / 259
   Jarrett Rudy

Contributors / 289
Index / 291
Illustrations


113 McCord family burial lot in Mount Royal Cemetery (ca. 1918). McCord Museum of Canadian History, Notman Photographic Archives, N-0000.130.1.

160 Gymnastics display, Dunham Ladies’ College (1910). Archives of the Anglican Diocese of Montreal, 164, Box 4 and Box Photo 1, “Calendar of the Dunham Ladies College.”

162 A Favorite Spot in Leisure Moments, Dunham Ladies’ College (1907-8). Archives of the Anglican Diocese of Montreal, 164, Box 4 and Box Photo 1, “Calendar of the Dunham Ladies College,” 34.

163 Dunham Ladies’ College (1907-8). Archives of the Anglican Diocese of Montreal, 164, Box 4 and Box Photo 1, “Calendar of the Dunham Ladies College,” 3.

164 Bedroom for two, Dunham Ladies’ College (1910-11). Archives of the Anglican Diocese of Montreal, 164, Box 4 and Box Photo 1, “Calendar of the Dunham Ladies College,” 20.


243 The Lumbo family grocery-meat market in the 1950s. Bibliothèque Nationale du Québec, Félix Barriere Collection, no. 2697.


274 Queen of Spades. *La Presse*, 24 September 1925, 23.

Acknowledgments

We wish to acknowledge the generous funding of Montreal History Group research projects by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada and Fonds Québécois de la recherche sur la société et la culture (formerly Fonds pour la formation de Chercheurs et l’Aide à la Recherche). This funding has enabled us to meet as a group of scholars scattered across the country and to hire many students and student members of the Montreal History Group to conduct research that contributed to the essays in this volume. We wish to thank all these researchers as well as the numerous archivists and librarians in Montreal, Ottawa, and Quebec City who facilitate our research on a daily basis. A special thanks to those members of the group who do not have articles in this collection. Their input has shaped and sharpened our thinking about the issues explored here and about history in general. We also wish to thank McGill University for providing us with office space that has been essential for our functioning as a growing research group as well as for many of our public conferences. Staff in the history department have also assisted on many fronts. A critical reading of the volume by Brian Young and anonymous readers helped us to clarify our points and in the end to produce a stronger book. Thanks to Tarah Brookfield who assisted us in pulling it all together into a coherent format for the initial submission. Finally, Emily Andrew and Ann Macklem have been an invaluable force in the process of creating this book and in expertly guiding us and the manuscript through the publishing stages at UBC Press.
Negotiating Identities in 19th- and 20th-Century Montreal
Introduction:
Negotiating Identities in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Montreal

Bettina Bradbury and Tamara Myers

In 1836 a Montreal butcher denounced Adelaide St-André, Henriette Hamelle, and Peggy Dollar to the police for regularly soliciting men on Papineau Road leading out of the city. Nearly a hundred years later, the female warden of McGill University’s residence for women students opened a smoking room for first- and second-year co-eds in the hope that this would discourage them from smoking in public. These incidents, separated by a century, and drawn from the opening and closing essays of this collection, are reminders of the link between place, historical moment, and the production of identity. The police in nineteenth-century Montreal fulfilled their duty to “know” and label certain women who claimed the streets; the female warden at McGill University guarded co-eds’ privileged class and feminine identities by keeping them and their habits off the street.

The examples of vagrant women and co-eds also point to the fact that women did not occupy public spaces on the same terms as men and emphasize that gender and class profoundly shaped women’s access to urban streets and the built environment and thus their identities. City spaces, of course, were never neutral locations. Men did not always occupy city streets with impunity either. Large groups of soldiers, sailors, and working-class or unemployed men on city streets provoked anxiety and action among urban elites, as did children selling newspapers, delivering groceries, or loitering. Age, class, religion, ethnicity, and respectability made a difference to what could be done where and by whom. Urban spaces were imbued with meanings that made them more accessible to some citizens than to others. The spatial organization of city life worked as a dynamic of power, shaped by and benefitting some while offering others the means of resistance, negotiation, and agency.

Montreal elites and reformers shaped the city by founding cultural institutions such as clubs, cemeteries, museums, and urban spaces like parks and neighbourhoods that reflected and perpetuated their class and ethnic identities. They were also in a position to build legal infrastructure and hire
regulatory personnel to contain the threat that transgressive people posed to “their” city, establishing institutions that excluded or contained the working classes, immigrants, and those of other religions. Those with less economic and social power worked within and contested these elite visions of the city.

These essays explore the ways that identities were produced and shaped in particular places and processes in Montreal across the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. They share three interrelated characteristics beyond
their common interest in the history of Montreal and institutions built and used by Montrealers. The first is their interest in how identities of gender, class, religion, age, or nation were negotiated and lived in Montreal between 1800 and the 1950s. In these essays readers will meet vagrant women, sailors in port, unemployed men of the Great Depression, elite families, widows, youth, students, shopkeepers, and female smokers as well as reformers, notaries, social workers, and educational authorities. As a counterbalance to the emphasis in much Quebec history on francophones and Catholics, the focus here is largely on the Scots, English, Irish, and Jews who would eventually be absorbed under the umbrella of “anglophones.”

Second, the places, institutions, and processes on which they focus all fell between or spanned the worlds of formal politics and family life. For this reason we have chosen to call them intermediate spaces. The locations traversed in these essays include the streets, homes for vagrants and transients, cemeteries, notaries’ offices, courtrooms, charitable and regulatory institutions, small family-run shops, high schools, universities, and the popular press. These essays also explore how these were places of potential freedom, self-expression, and assertion of citizenship claims and concurrently sites of unequal power relations and places of moral and social regulation.

This collection offers a range of ways to explore the fluidity of boundaries between public and private, the dynamics of identity formation, and forms of regulation and resistance. We have arranged these eleven empirical studies of the relationships between place, identity, agency, and regulation around four themes. The first is homelessness; the second is death, burial, and widowhood; the third is youth and identity; and the fourth is selling and consumption. We hope that the essays will be of interest to anyone working on questions about the changing meanings of public and private, identity formation, the law, and moral regulation; to readers interested in the history of women, gender, families, youth, death, consumption, and cities; and to those attracted specifically to the history of Montreal and its people.

The individual chapters of this book are part of the broader research projects of the Montreal History Group. Over the past twenty years, the interests of this group and its predecessor have encompassed research on the transition to industrial capitalism in Montreal; on questions of property rights, class, gender, and the law; and most recently on the issues of family, governance, and intermediate space that are addressed here. Like so many other historians of the past few decades, we have struggled collectively and individually to integrate materialist understandings about class, gender, and power with the most convincing insights of new cultural history and of post-structuralist analyses. Our collective and individual research has helped to reshape understandings of Montreal families, women’s
unpaid and professional work, the criminal justice system, the law, and the
Civil Code. Group members have always combined an interest in broad
theoretical questions with systematic empirical research fed by the city’s
rich archival sources, including parish registers, notarial and judicial records,
institutional records, family papers, and newspapers. In this collection, group
members have mined a wide range of the city’s primary sources to reveal
diverse aspects of Montreal’s social and cultural past.

**Thinking about Identity Formation, Intermediate Spaces, Agency, and Regulation**

These essays draw from a wide range of empirical and theoretical literature
to approach the interrelated concepts of identity formation, intermediate
spaces, agency, and regulation. These concepts can be disaggregated for dis-
cussion, but as most of the empirical research that informs the essays shows,
they worked concurrently in specific historical moments. Few subjects have
provoked as much interest or debate among historians and other scholars
in the past few decades as has the question of identities. Scholars in a range
of disciplines have explored how identities are formed; how identity is dis-
cursively constructed; the relationship between identity and experience;
how identities of gender, race, class, and sexuality are mutually constitui-
tive; how European bourgeois identities were made and remade in the con-
text of imperial expansion; the place of self-regulation and moral regulation
in the forging of identities; and the relationships between gender, race,
and place. In Canada, as Adamoski, Chunn, and Menzies argue, “national
problems of unity and identity have been all the more magnified by the
centripetal forces of localism, and regionalism ... [and] the triadic geometry
of indigenous, francophone and anglophone heritage.” In Quebec most
writing has focused on national identity and/or class, largely excluding iden-
tities of gender, race, or ethnicity beyond the two solitudes.

In this collection we consider identities of class, nation, gender, age, and
religion as mutually constitutive and historically specific, although readers
will find that each essay addresses the question of identity formation in its
own way. Most authors conceptualize identities as sets of understandings
that are produced discursively and expressed culturally as well as negoti-
ated, performed, and reshaped collectively and individually in the unequal
social and class relations of daily life. Thus we build on the vast body of
feminist and antiracist scholarship that argues that racial, ethnic, gender,
and age-related identities are made rather than innate. As historians we
seek to determine how they were made in specific historical contexts and
through particular relations with various “others.” The Montrealers studied
here were divided and united in the religions that they practised, their class
positions and cultures, the languages that they spoke, and their gender. We
seek to capture some of the diverse ways that Montrealers expressed their
identities, sought to shape and mould others, or challenged dominant understandings at different points in time.

We approach these questions about how identity was produced and negotiated in particular sites by examining what we call “intermediate spaces.” Our use of this term builds on the ideas of scholars working from a range of theoretical perspectives who have criticized the idea that differences of gender, race, and class in the past can be best understood through the dichotomies of separate spheres: public and private, family and state, or home and work. The idea of intermediate space serves to highlight the wide range of historical situations and institutions that, like those studied in these essays, fit uneasily within these dichotomies yet were critical in shaping people’s lives and identities. In different ways, each of the papers reveals empirically how conceptualizing individual experiences and identities through the lenses of such dichotomies can hide the myriad ways that tasks identified with one sphere took place elsewhere and how Montrealers traversed boundaries associated with gender, age, class, or national identity.

We build on three main bodies of feminist historiography in thinking about the public, the private, and intermediate spaces: separate-spheres literature; scholarship on the relationship between families, home, and work or between production and reproduction; and writing that explores questions of public space and Jürgen Habermas’ idea of a public sphere. Historians working in each of these areas over the past thirty years have reached several shared conclusions that challenge the interpretation of women’s oppression as rooted in their confinement to the domestic sphere of the home, the devaluation of their paid and domestic labour, or their exclusion from the public sphere of political debate. First, they have shown empirically the multiple ways that many women were not confined to the home or to the domestic or the private realm. Second, they have insisted that gender never works alone, noting that gender is always constituted concurrently with race, class, and ethnicity. Third, rather than take the idea of separate spheres, of paid and unpaid labour, or of the public sphere for granted as describing actual gender roles, they have dissected the ways that such concepts emerged concurrently with new understandings of gender, class, race, and citizenship at times when politics, the economy, and the nation were being transformed. Such findings combine with research in a wide range of disciplines and other areas of historical inquiry to reveal how such new understandings were forged in relationship to each other. Differences between men and women, races, ethnicities, and even class were never fixed, nor were they markers of separate or biological categories. Rather, the identities associated with such differences were made and remade in specific historical contexts.

From these rich bodies of scholarship we draw three main conclusions that frame our thinking about intermediate spaces. First, from arguments
about the limited usefulness of the idea of separate spheres as a way to describe gender and other axes of difference, we take seriously Leonore Davidoff’s suggestion that “key questions about the creation of identity have to be extended beyond family, home and childhood. The ragged frontiers between public and private must be recognized as a site where identity – of race, ethnicity and class and sexual orientation as well as gender – is formed.” Second, most authors here join socialist feminists in their interest in the material conditions of people’s lives and in insisting on the importance of class relations and of tracing the complex links between home and work and production and reproduction. Third, the work of feminist historians investigating the “public sphere,” where ideas were exchanged through word, print, and associations, has shown how the individual citizen who was seen as fit to take part in the new forms of formal politics and government in republics, democracies, and constitutional monarchies of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries was a class-specific, racialized, and gendered individual. He could only be male, although citizenship did not necessarily include all men, and women did participate in a range of intermediary political activities. From this literature we draw especially on the argument that those excluded from the new institutions of formal politics and the “public sphere” by their gender, age, race, or religion found their own ways of influencing society, creating in the process multiple and competing “publics” that could in the long run open up more inclusive possibilities.

The sites, the intermediate spaces, and the processes studied in these essays, then, do not focus primarily on formal politics, the institutions of the public sphere, the state, or waged labour. Nor do they zero in primarily on spaces that were familial or the focus of private life. They deal with the in-between institutions of reform, shelter, education, and control and with the processes that took people between homes and cemeteries and between families and shops – that is, onto the streets. In this sense these essays collectively join with the work of other Canadian historians who have studied the streets, exhibitions, or taverns as spaces that can best be understood through the questions raised by the debates over the public and the private. They intersect with the arguments of feminist geographers who stress the importance of examining how identities are constructed, regulated, and represented in diverse places on the spatial scales of the body, home, streets, workplaces, communities, nation states, and global relations. And they join a growing body of literature in urban history that looks at the ways that urban places were racialized and gendered and how identity was shaped and configured in urban space.

These sets of literature raise further questions that inform how the authors grapple with the question of intermediate spaces and the ragged frontiers between public and private. How and for what reasons did men, women,
and youths move between homes, shops, the streets, cemeteries, institutions of learning or containment, or notarial offices and the courts? In what ways did familial relationships, domestic tasks, and domestic architecture function materially and discursively elsewhere than in the home – on the streets, in a high school, or in homes for sailors or unemployed men? How, as Mary Anne Poutanen asks, did the homeless procure food and shelter? And when was domestic space opened up for other purposes or to police, notaries, reformers, officials from the legal system, or social workers? How were particular places, spaces, or actions – like smoking – gendered, racialized, or associated with a particular ethnicity, religion, or class?

In seeking to answer these questions, most of the essays address the old and thorny question about individual agency in the context of unequal power relations and the control and regulation exercised by police, reformers, the law and its agents, social workers, religious and other authorities, and those with the power to shape understandings of etiquette and respectability. In so doing they join the growing body of scholarly work interested in social control, moral regulation, and governmentality, blending insights from this literature with understandings about class relations drawn from historical writings on working-class culture and society as well as from related literature that seeks to contextualize these issues within a history of liberalism, individualism, the self, and the growing influence of consumer culture.

The multifaceted concept of “the social” has received much attention over recent decades, especially from scholars of moral regulation. Denise Riley described it as the “blurred ground between the old public and private” voiced as a field of intervention. According to her definition, as in the vast body of literature inspired by Foucault, the social encompasses the wide range of “technologies of power” and the “rubric of laws, regulations, rules, policies and institutions” through which philanthropists or experts sought to discipline and to teach self-discipline. In these papers we consider the social as a prime site of moral regulation, resistance, and identity formation. Here the social includes physical spaces such as the Sailors’ Institute, the Day Shelter for Unemployed Men, the Dunham Ladies’ College, university campuses, and the Montreal Juvenile Delinquents’ Court. It also encompassed “clients’” relationships with police, charitable workers, and eventually experts. We see social workers interact with clients, with community religious groups, and with state officials, sharing the language of categories and discipline. Bureaucratic rules and recordkeeping shaped these new kinds of interactions at the same time, thus producing a growing number of records for future historians. New relationships between experts and their objects reconstituted identities and subjectivities through forms of moral regulation that were aimed at working-class as well as racialized and gendered subjects. These “subjects” negotiated their own
spaces, resisted regulation and surveillance, and brought competing meanings to their interactions with experts.

Other interventions were educative rather than directly coercive, aiming to forge self-controlled, educated citizens or to produce new groups of consumers. The regulatory aspects of the intermediate spaces studied here transcend the usual focus of moral-regulation literature. In these essays authors also consider how the civil law shaped widows’ claims and contained their sexuality; how the Protestant elite used headstones and prominent cemetery location to ensure that their presence remained visible, in contrast to the unmarked graves of the proletarian dead; how school and university authorities sought to produce particular understandings of identity among students; the regulation of children’s labour in small family businesses; and the Montrealers who sought to shape etiquette, behaviour, and consumption.²⁵

**The Context: Montreal, 1800-1950**

The issues we raise have been explored in a variety of geographical and historical circumstances. The changing dynamics of economic growth and social and cultural relations in Montreal form the context for the chapters that follow. In the period covered by the chapters of this book, Montreal changed from a feudal, preindustrial town into an industrial-capitalist city and then into a cosmopolitan metropolis. It grew from a small centre in a conquered colony into the largest and most important Canadian city in a province that was constantly agonizing over its place within the federal state. At the end of the eighteenth century, its inhabitants were predominantly characterized by French and Catholic ethnic, religious, and linguistic identities. Then followed a period during the nineteenth century when English-speaking Protestants and Catholics equalled or outnumbered the French. By the early twentieth century, Montreal had become a multicultural city characterized by a French-speaking majority, a powerful English minority, and large immigrant populations.²⁶

Chronologically, these essays begin in the decades following the cession of New France to Britain in 1763. The Conquest changed Montreal only slowly until the early nineteenth century. The Sulpicians remained the seigneurs of the town. Matters of family, money, and property continued to be organized largely in accordance with tradition and the rules of the Custom of Paris, whereas British law was applied in criminal matters. Thus immigrants arriving from the British Isles or the American colonies had to learn about the ways that French law organized questions of commerce, family, and property. Men continued to work as artisans, labourers, farmers, notaries, doctors, merchants, and farmers as well as in the fur trade. Women sewed, cooked, cleaned, and raised children or cared for the sick and aging as wives and daughters and as nuns and sisters. Workplaces were seldom separate from the dwellings where families slept and ate.
French colonial culture remained conspicuous in the city’s architecture and in the dominance of the French language. The Catholic Church continued to exercise a critical social and spiritual role, although its officials would secure neither sufficient religious recruits nor political power before the 1840s to ensure a steady hold over either their flocks or broader policy. On the streets British soldiers garrisoned in the town were visible reminders of British rule. Until their departure in 1871, they were also frequently a source of disorder, cavorting with prostitutes and seducing local women, as Mary Anne Poutanen shows in her essay on vagrant women.27

Some of the earliest new arrivals were colonial officials and entrepreneurs like John McCord, an Ulster Scot, who had provisioned the British troops during the war and whose family is the subject of Brian Young’s chapter.28 A small but influential group of Scottish, English, and American merchants arrived following the Conquest and the American War of Independence. This English-speaking mercantile elite enriched itself through trade, often in furs, and secured influence and appointments from British authority. By the beginning of the nineteenth century, they were transforming the city’s cultural landscape as they oversaw the building of institutions, urban spaces, and homes reflective of their imperial vision. Although their offices were in the walled city cheek by jowl with those of the notaries and Canadien merchants, their mansions spread away from the river far beyond the city walls. They built churches representing their particular religious beliefs within the city walls. Jews built a place of worship in 1777, and Presbyterians built St. Gabriel Street Church in the heart of the old city in 1792. Anglicans erected Christ Church (1805-21) within a block of the Catholic parish church that had served Catholic Montrealers since the late seventeenth century. Within decades the Catholic community responded by building themselves a huge new Gothic Revival–style church behind the old one and next to the Seminary of the Sulpicians, who were the feudal landlords of the island of Montreal. A British aesthetic and Protestant institutions thus mingled with French colonial and Catholic ones.29 Marriages occurred within and across religions and cultures. And some Montrealers, like one of the couples that Bettina Bradbury follows from marriage to widowhood, moved between these religious and linguistically distinct institutions, marrying in a Presbyterian church and buying a pew and holding funerals in a Catholic one.

Although Montreal seemed rather like a small, medieval, European walled city to many visitors at the beginning of the nineteenth century, by the early 1840s much had changed. The city walls were demolished, opening the old city to the largely artisan-dominated suburbs that had grown up outside the old city gates. Spaces along the waterfront and streets were widened, and British-style public squares were introduced, opening up new public spaces for walking, troop movement, public meetings, and
religious and military parades. Building the Lachine Canal increased Montreal’s access to inland shipping, and renovations to the port followed.

Migration from the surrounding countryside and the arrival of immigrants from England, Scotland, and Ireland fuelled the city’s growth. In 1800 there had been well under ten thousand inhabitants. By 1843 there were over forty-four thousand, and English-speaking residents outnumbered the French. By the 1820s there were three major ethnic/religious communities: French Canadian Catholics, or “Canadiens,” Irish Catholics, and Protestants. A very small Jewish community had also taken root.

The years leading up to the early 1840s were ones of transformation in many ways. As Montreal’s influence in the fur trade declined, merchants shifted their interests into exporting wheat and procuring firewood for local markets or lumber for export to England, or they turned to new ventures, such as banks, real estate, shipping, and production. Industrial production (e.g., beer, sugar, and ships) was fundamental in the accumulation of new capitalist wealth. Within the city, growing numbers of sons of francophone artisans and farmers became part of an expanding professional class, which included publishers and politicians central to the patriot movement. Ethnic divisions hardened as the city’s anglophone elite clashed with canadien, Irish, and other supporters of the Patriots in newspapers, on the streets, in the lengthy and tragic by-election of 1832, and again from 1837 to 1838 as the colony veered into the period of the rebellions.

Montreal was incorporated as a city in 1833 during an era of contested and evolving visions of citizenship. The new charter specified that only property owners could vote and that voters had to be male. Women, who had voted in substantial numbers in the 1832 colonial by-elections, were gradually being pushed out of the changing sphere of politics at all formal levels. Bourgeois understandings of gender and marriage, in which a leisureed wife was supported by her husband and freed from hard labour through the work of domestics, were spreading. Yet this idea of separate spheres bore little meaning for the many Montreal wives of artisans or farmers whose labour might involve feeding and clothing apprentices, work in the shop, or balancing the books. For women without roofs over their heads or working as domestics or prostitutes, the very idea was moot.

The curtailment of formal political options did not prevent bourgeois women from shaping their city. As poverty increased in Montreal over these years, heightened by epidemics, fluctuations in the world economy, and immigration, growing numbers of lay Catholic and Protestant women became involved in a range of new charitable activities, providing for widows and orphans, unwed mothers, and the poor. In so doing they shared in shaping “the social”: the new intermediate space of social activity that was defined neither by the realm of the state nor by the informal sphere of family or neighbourly assistance. In the years after the rebellions, the
Catholic Church established hegemony over the delivery of education and social assistance to Catholics in the province and the city, ensuring that religious institutions, rather than the state, would shape this domain of social involvement. This realm of the social was also an arena of cross-class relationships, in which Catholic clergy, Protestant ministers, and relatively privileged citizens decided which of the poor, immigrants, outcasts, or unemployed should be helped and what they should receive. Those who were turned down had to fend for themselves – in their homes if they had them and on the streets.

Between the late 1830s and the end of the century, relations of class, ethnicity, religion, and gender shifted as immigration and ongoing industrialization reshaped the city. Ordinances passed by the Special Council following the rebellions gave new power to Montreal’s police force. They reshaped laws governing property, the economy, and family matters. In subsequent decades anglophone and francophone jurists cooperated in dismantling the seigneurial system and in consolidating laws within a new Civil Code for the colony/province. Merchants and entrepreneurs promoted the building of steamships and a network of railroads that linked the city to other parts of the colony, to the United States, and to Britain.

The city’s artisans and, increasingly, its skilled and unskilled workers built the boats and the railway stock and also manufactured much of the clothing, footwear, fabric, tobacco, paper goods, and other commodities that made industrial producers wealthy. A growing number of the city’s men and women were employed in large factories that were increasingly likely to be powered by steam and to use machinery of many kinds. Divisions between home and work hardened, and the distances between the two increased. As Bettina Bradbury has argued, even working-class wives and mothers did not usually take on industrial labour except in situations of crisis. Children, and especially adolescents, were critical contributors of wages and of domestic labour in many families, as few males earned a sufficient daily wage or secured enough days of work in a year to support a family on their own. Unemployment and poverty grew further with the city’s population and with the exploitation and irregular earning characteristic of a capitalist labour market subject to both seasonal and cyclical unemployment.

The industrializing port city became the destination for even greater numbers of immigrants from surrounding parishes and from overseas, pushing Montreal’s population from over 107,000 in 1871 to around 250,000 at the turn of the century and to over 1,000,000 by the 1950s. Successive waves of immigrants reshaped the ethnic and religious composition of the city. In the early nineteenth century, it was the immigrants from Ireland and the British Isles who contributed to English speakers outnumbering French Canadians. By the time of the 1871 census, French Canadians made up just over half of the population again. Toward the end of the nineteenth
century, massive immigration began to produce an even more multiracial and cosmopolitan city. Lines of class and ethnicity solidified as specific parts of the city became identified with particular groups. Increasingly over the century, francophones became concentrated in the east of the city, while Jews, Italians, Chinese, and other new groups of immigrants were drawn to the centre, pressing northward on the streets parallel to St. Lawrence Boulevard (the Main). Anglophones tended to cluster in the western parts of the city, initially with the Irish nearer the canal and the river and the elite housed on the streets that stretched up the mountain to form the Golden Square Mile and that spilled over into the new municipality of Westmount.

The city's elites – whether French or English – built homes on the slopes of Mount Royal, distancing themselves residentially from the unemployed and poor of the industrial city, from the newly arrived immigrants, and from the prostitutes and seamen who clustered around the port. These groups contributed to the making of rough areas in the city, predominantly male spaces that also encouraged and sustained a thriving business in prostitution, drawing women onto the streets. The port and the downtown red-light district on St. Lawrence Boulevard took on unsavoury reputations that tarnished individuals and the communities that frequented them. Bourgeois Montreal's respectability and reputation rested and depended upon the existence of its opposite – the prostitute, the vagrant, and the thief. Darcy Ingram demonstrates this critical relationship in his chapter on the home that philanthropic Montrealers created for sailors in port.

In response to immigrants, transients, and prostitutes who claimed and shaped parts of the city and its public spaces, established Montrealers developed complex networks of philanthropic and charitable work. Their aim was simple: to provide material sustenance and moral guidance while exercising an element of social control over those whose afflictions included poverty, disease, abandonment, delinquency, and homelessness. The numbers of men and especially women who took religious vows and staffed the Catholic schools, asylums, orphanages, institutions for the elderly, jails, reformatories, and shelters or provided for the poor and sick in their homes and in hospitals grew dramatically. Across the city, in the face of the weak involvement of the state in social and educational domains, Protestants built parallel philanthropic institutions. Late in the century, prominent Jewish industrialists similarly funded a social-service network specifically addressing the perceived needs of Jewish newcomers, as Tamara Myers demonstrates in her essay in this collection. Thus an extensive web of disciplinary and charitable institutions intervened in the lives of prostitutes, orphans, and delinquents.

From the nineteenth century on, Catholics and Protestants decided to build some of their educational institutions far away from the port and the disorder of the industrializing city. McGill University’s founders benefitted
from the endowment of one of the city’s leading merchants. When con-
struction of McGill was undertaken in 1831, its site was well north of the
city. In the 1860s the Sulpicians moved their boys’ seminary far from the
heart of the old city to the southwestern slopes of Mount Royal. Similarly,
as Marie-Ève Harbec describes in her chapter, the Anglicans went even fur-
ther, building Dunham Ladies’ College for their daughters in the pastoral
and resolutely Protestant Eastern Townships. After the Second World War,
Montreal’s Catholic university, initially a branch of Laval University, was
moved to its new campus on the other side of Mount Royal from McGill.
Similarly, as the city population grew denser, Catholics, Protestants, and
Jews moved their burial grounds from urban locations to isolated sites on
Mount Royal. There, as Brian Young’s chapter argues, they reproduced the
inequalities and religious identities of the city below, sifting the dead spa-
tially by religion and between poor grounds and elite lots.38

Fundamental changes in work, consumption patterns, and family life
contributed to the making of twentieth-century Montreal. The evolution
toward a modern metropolis could be seen in new institutions, in architec-
ture, and in the increased importance of commercial leisure, shops, and
consumers. Girls and young women with some training were increasingly
likely to find work in offices and stores as clerical and sales positions multi-
plied and as manufacturing declined relative to other sectors of the economy.
Department stores attracted growing numbers of shoppers, especially women,
into new public commercial spaces. Streetcars and then the automobile
moved Montrealers more rapidly to their work and to these new places of
leisure and consumption. The 1930s saw the first supermarkets challenge
the hold of the numerous small neighbourhood-based groceries through-
out the city. Yet, as Sylvie Taschereau writes in her chapter, family-run gro-
cerries continued to operate betwixt and between homes and commercial
avenues.

Popular culture, the press, publicity, and film took on new importance in
shaping the ways that people experienced and understood the city, their
place within it, and their identities. Movies, jazz clubs, and a range of other
commercial pursuits also marked Montreal’s passage to modernity. The char-
acter of St. Catherine Street was transformed as it became the new centre of
consumption and leisure in Canada.39 In modern Montreal, anonymous
spaces (especially downtown) attracted new generations of youth. These
new forces challenged the influence of church and family as sources of iden-
tity formation and regulation.

Modern Montreal also hosted new groupings of citizens. Unions, femi-
nist groups, associations of employers, and student and other youth groups
added to existing religious or ethnically based associations as Montrealers
sought to express their identities and their needs. As the city’s universities
grew in size and importance, university students, as Karine Hébert’s chapter
elucidates, performed their identities on the streets of Montreal, insisting on their inclusion as citizens.

Charitable work and institutional traditions were transformed over the twentieth century with the development of professional social science and social work. Between the 1920s and the Second World War, professionals and experts trained in social work increasingly worked with or took over from lay volunteers and religious charity workers as the main social-service workers. Social-work programs at McGill and later at the University of Montreal trained growing numbers of Montrealers of all origins, including priests and nuns, in the art of “modern,” casework-based social work. Casework became central to the assessment of family life and to decisions about bestowing or withholding economic support. Neither modernity nor modern social work could eradicate poverty in the city, as the collapse of capitalist businesses across the world in the 1930s made abundantly clear. Anna Shea and Suzanne Morton illustrate the modern experiments in resolving unemployment that staff from McGill’s Faculty of Social Work spearheaded at the Day Shelter for Unemployed Men during the Depression.

In the early twentieth century, social workers joined feminists and other reformers in targeting a range of modern behaviour that they deemed problematic. Of particular interest were young men and women who took advantage of the new public venues and urban spaces for entertainment, sociability, and sexual encounters. Montreal’s anglophone and francophone feminists were among the groups that worried about “the girl problem.” Indeed, like their counterparts in the rest of Canada and much of the Western world, they played an important role in the process of identifying problems, proposing solutions, creating institutions, and working as both volunteers and professionals. For example, in 1918 Montreal feminists succeeded in their campaign to have policewomen patrol the streets arresting girls who looked as if they might go astray. In the parallel movement, which Tamara Myers examines in her essay in this collection, Montreal’s growing Jewish community embarked on antidelinquency work, worried that misbehaviour among the youth of the latest immigrants would tarnish the reputation that older generations had struggled to forge in a climate of growing anti-Semitism. They chose scientific social work combined with rigorous preventative community work and policing of the streets as the best way to deal with such social problems.

Fears about modern “girls” (too much dancing, smoking, and sex appeal) and new urban temptations thus joined older concerns about prostitution and poverty, as Tamara Myers has demonstrated. Influential French Canadian nationalists worried that the increasing visibility of women and youth – blamed variously on American values, modernity, or wartime dislocation and the feminist movement – harkened moral decline and family peril. In his chapter, Jarrett Rudy charts the changing responses to women’s
smoking, showing how women’s choices, advertising, and popular culture combined to make public smoking more acceptable and modern for women.

The Essays
During their city’s transformation from a walled town into a modern metropolis of skyscrapers, cigarette smokers, movies, and cars, Montrealers grappled with their own identities of age, gender, class, religion, ethnicity, and language and with their relationships to others. The results were mixtures of cooperation and divisive nationalism, pride, and prejudice. The rich social and cultural past of this complex, changing urban environment provides the backdrop to this volume’s studies of identity formation in Montreal. Broad questions about identity formation, intermediate spaces, agency, and moral regulation unite these essays across the four separate themes into which they are grouped. Dealing humanely with the homeless is a major challenge in contemporary Canada. In the first section of this collection, three essays address the past history of this problem. They explore how the homeless expressed their identities as men or women, as people without homes, as unemployed, as family members, or as sailors away from home. They also examine some of the ways that understandings of class, nation, empire, ethnicity, and gender shaped the responses of the police, reformers, and social workers who had the power to regulate their lives. Mary Anne Poutanen asks about the range of relationships and identities that vagrant women, who were mostly either Irish or French Canadian Catholics, assumed as they sought succour and shelter in early-nineteenth-century Montreal and about the ways that police identified and dealt with homeless females. Darcy Ingram explores the ways that sailors in port in the second half of the nineteenth century were symbols both of the ties of empire and of potential sexual and class disorder on the streets of Montreal. The reformers who founded a “home away from home” for these men were motivated by anxieties and hopes that were similar in some ways to those that led a group of progressive Montreal social scientists during the Depression of the 1930s to found the Day Shelter for Unemployed Men, which Anna Shea and Suzanne Morton examine. Both institutions sought to minimize the dangers that large numbers of working-class men roaming the streets of the city were understood to pose to women and to order. And both sought to provide men without homes with safe places, some of the domestic comforts of home, and religion and discipline. How, these authors ask, did reformers running such homes seek to bolster certain aspects of men’s identities and minimize others? How did the men accept, resist, or subvert these goals?

The ways that people deal with death have varied dramatically across time and across cultures. Contemporary Canadians are struggling with the legacies of the twentieth-century denial of death. The two essays examining
death, burial, and widowhood focus on the nineteenth century, a time that historians have described as one of extravagant funerals and grieving and during which the rituals surrounding death were more public and rooted in family, religion, and community than today. Young and Bradbury probe the multiple ways in which death marked a time when identities of class, gender, self, family, and citizenship were asserted and when new identities were assumed. Young asks how Montreal's Protestant elite used their power to shape cultural institutions in order to ensure that their religious, class, and national identities and influence would be maintained not just during their lives, but also after their deaths. Bradbury explores the ways that women whose husbands died took on their new identities as widows and how class, age, the law, and custom shaped this transition from wife to widow.

One of the most important emergent identities of the twentieth century was that of the adolescent. Although scholars have declared the recent demise of adolescence, historians find the past century a fruitful period for the examination of youth and the moulding of identities. In Montreal, as elsewhere, the possibility of youth going astray and compromising the reputations of their family, class, ethnic, or religious groups has provoked the creation of a range of institutions of socialization, containment, and control. Marie-Ève Harbec, Tamara Myers, and Karine Hébert investigate some of the ways that control over the discursive category of youth and young people, which included their ideas, bodies, and actions, became critical in times of political and social upheaval. How, these historians ask, did authorities – in these cases, the leaders of the Anglican Church, Catholic and Protestant administrators of French and English universities, and Jewish social workers and community leaders – seek to shape youth? What kinds of institutions did they create, who did they employ, and what understandings of identity did they promote as they sought to control the class, religious, and cultural identities of young people? We have seen that the Anglican elite of Montreal decided in the wake of the disestablishment of their church in the 1850s to create a college for girls away from the bustle and danger of the city and that established Jewish Montrealers created their own network of social-service agencies to contain the potential damage that they feared if too many of the youth of more recent immigrants ended up in the provincial juvenile courts. But how did young people articulate their own sense of identity? Harbec shows how young women in the Anglican college were encouraged to develop their identity as elite, Protestant females by decorating their own rooms in the college and by undergoing a thorough education that opened up the potential for a career instead of marriage. Hébert explores the ways that students at the University of Montreal and McGill sought to articulate student identities different from that proposed by university authorities and how these changed across the first half of the twentieth century. Myers looks at how, in the interwar
period, the established Jewish community attempted to contain the challenge that they feared a new generation of Jewish immigrant youth posed to their fragile place in this predominantly French Catholic and Anglo-Protestant city.

Victoria de Grazia, a historian of consumption, has argued that “acts of exchange and consumption have long been obsessively gendered, usually as female.” From two quite different perspectives, the final two essays explore the identities of age, gender, class, and ethnicity among those involved in exchange and in consumption. Sylvie Taschereau asks how, in the context of the Depression of the 1930s and the expansion of supermarkets, the keepers of small shops juggled their identities as workers, family members, and distributors of credit. Her subjects are Jewish, French Canadian, and Anglo-Protestant families who ran small shops selling foodstuffs. Their survival depended on the links of credit and trust that they built up with their neighbours and with their suppliers. Jarrett Rudy, in contrast, seeks to understand issues of gender and identity in the context of a developing mass market in cigarettes and as part of the broader transformations in liberal citizenship. He shows that old associations of tobacco products with men, prostitutes, and racialized women were broken down as cigarette smoking was made respectable. Movies, marketing, and the women themselves were important elements in this contested process.

Notes
2 Collective publications include: Donald Fyson, Colin M. Coates, and Kathryn Harvey, Class, Gender and the Law in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Quebec: Sources and Perspectives (Montreal: Montreal History Group, 1993); Donald Fyson, with Evelyn Kolish and Virginia Schweitzer, The Court Structure of Quebec and Lower Canada, 1764 to 1860 (Montreal: Montreal History Group, 1994); Tamara Myers, Kate Boyer, Mary Anne Poutanen, and Steven Watt, Power, Place and Identity: Historical Studies of Social and Legal Regulation in Quebec (Montreal: Montreal History Group, 1998).


Thus several of the essays address Ian McKay's call for looking at class power beyond the realm of the economic and investigating how elites “secure cultural leadership” over subaltern groups through both coercion and consent. “The Liberal Order Framework: A Prospectus for a Reconnaissance of Canadian History,” *Canadian Historical Review* 81, 4 (December 2000): 617-45 at 628.


On the McCords, see Young in this collection.


Olson and Thornton, “Familles montréalaises” and “The Challenge of the Irish Catholic Community.”


Jean-Marie Fecteau argues that the extent to which “the social” remained outside the responsibility of all levels of the state in Quebec was unprecedented in the Western world and that it led to the creation of a veritable Catholic civil society. La Liberté du pauvre: Crime et pauvreté au XIXe siècle Québécois (Montreal: VLB Éditeur, 2004).


Jean-Marie Fecteau, Un nouvel ordre des choses: La pauvreté, le crime et l’État au Québec, de la fin du XVIIIe siècle à 1840 (Outremont: VLB Éditeur, 1989); Fecteau, La liberté du pauvre.

On Dunham Ladies’ College, see Harbec in this collection. On the Protestant cemetery, see Young.

Linteau, Histoire de Montréal, 306.

