UBCPress

Conclusion: Revealing the Campaign Machine

Anna Lennox Esselment
& Thierry Giasson
Pages 207–226

Inside the Campaign:
Managing Elections in Canada
Edited by Alex Marland
& Thierry Giasson

OPEN ACCESS

Copyright: UBC Press, 2020
ISBN 9780774864688 (PDF)
www.ubcpress.ca/inside-the-campaign

Open Access Version of a Printed Book Chapter
This chapter is the open access version of a chapter in *Inside the Campaign: Managing Elections in Canada*, available for purchase in paperback from UBC Press. Please encourage your university library to purchase a paperback version of the book and/or purchase one yourself.

Notification of Copyright

Cover Artwork

COMMUNICATION
STRATEGY
AND POLITICS

Conclusion

Revealing the Campaign Machine

Anna Lennox Esselment and Thierry Giasson

In this conclusion, we present a summary of the different contributions comprising the book. We reflect on the challenges inherent in descriptive research coauthored by academics and practitioners. We highlight three themes common to professional election practices: caretaking in governance during elections, the essential roles that collaboration and coordination play in campaigns, and the centrality of communication in elections. We also reflect on the hybrid character of postmodern campaigns in which digital and traditional forms of electioneering coexist. Finally, we look toward future Parliaments and elections in Canada.

Ce dernier chapitre présente un résumé des différentes contributions contenues dans le livre. Il porte sur les défis inhérents à la recherche descriptive corédigée par des universitaires et des praticiens. Le chapitre met en lumière trois thèmes communs aux pratiques électorales professionnelles, à savoir la gouvernance au cours des élections, le rôle essentiel que la collaboration et la coordination doivent jouer dans les campagnes, et le caractère central de la communication dans les élections. Il se penche également sur le caractère hybride des campagnes postmodernes où coexistent les formes numériques et traditionnelles des tactiques électorales. Le chapitre se termine en initiant une réflexion sur l'impact de la campagne permanente sur les prochaines législatures et élections canadiennes.

AN ELECTION CAMPAIGN demands the Herculean effort of marshalling diverse roles for the common goal of winning power and influence. In Stephen Clarkson's book *The Big Red Machine: How the Liberal Party Dominates Canadian Politics,* an analogy links a campaign with a Rube Goldberg machine whose complexity greatly overwhelms the task.[1] The straightforward objective of a campaign machine is to win an election. Achieving that task, however, is a complicated and an involved undertaking. Indeed, a campaign operation can have varied goals – from a political party winning the most seats to form the government to a single candidate in an electoral district seeking to become an MP. This volume unveils the parts that make up the machine; in other words, it exposes the roles responsible for the whirring, steaming, whistling, and clanking that go into an election campaign in Canada.

The information presented here is unique. This is the first Canadian book to provide a concise detailing of behind-the-scenes work on campaigns from practitioners of various partisan or professional backgrounds. Their willingness to share their knowledge goes some way toward clarifying the different roles required to prepare for and engage in modern campaigning. We now have a greater awareness of how those positions contribute to the task of winning seats in the House of Commons and how personnel confront challenges that arise during an election. At its core, this book describes groups of talented individuals committed to a process at the root of the democratic experiment. Some of them quietly keep the government going while the parties engage in their public battle for votes. Others manage the news cycle to ensure that Canadians receive stories that will inform them about the parties and their leaders. Alternatively, they guard against the tarnishing of a leader's image.

This book's descriptions of campaign jobs are unorthodox. The willingness of practitioners to offer their time, expertise, and patience in walking us through their roles speaks to their interest in helping Canadians understand their work. As set out in the Introduction, there are challenges with embarking on this kind of project. Securing a practitioner coauthor was sometimes a difficult

task. Whereas academic careers involve publishing peer-reviewed research, offering such an enticement to a potential practitioner collaborator can land with a thud. The motivations of those who agreed to take part were much different. The chance to dispel myths, clarify a position, tout a new role, affirm their expertise, and/or advance their interpretations of the world they occupy are some possibilities. There is a keen recognition that the balance of power is heavily in one camp. The practitioners are the doers; they are in the thick of it. As academics, we are the observers, the hangers-on, the ones hoping to be invited in. That a practitioner could withdraw from collaborating was always a possibility that would compromise the venture. What's more, the academic authors had to be sensitive to the contents, observations, and findings with which the practitioners would be comfortable. Academics are trained to provide critical perspectives and embedding observations deep in scholarly literature, but this project was a different sort of undertaking and therefore had to be seen through a novel lens.

Volumes like this one aim to involve viewpoints from all parties and all possible campaign roles, but an ongoing challenge for researchers is to convince decision makers and campaign operatives to open up about their worlds and give us peeks inside them.[2] Efforts to include Liberal Party practitioners were less successful. Governing party status is the likely culprit here. Parties on the opposition benches tend to have more enthusiasm for such projects; had the Conservatives been in power, we expect that their willingness to be involved would have been equally tepid – this is the reality confronting researchers in this field. Our hope is that the contribution of books like this one will encourage more campaign insiders to pull back the curtain and explain to Canadians what they do. The roles are fascinating and affect politics in this country; we simply want to learn more about them.

In the end, the partnerships presented here were fruitful, congenial, honest, and revealing. Inevitably, events in the 2019 federal election campaign are prominent, and the chapters in this book are the first of what will be numerous published analyses of that

election. Our purpose here is to draw out broader themes that might augment understandings of professional practices and functions from campaigns in the recent past, the present, and the near future. Ours is a rapid response to recent events. This book should therefore be received as foremost a contribution to knowledge in the emerging subfield of political management and, to a lesser extent, a first draft of the 2019 campaign story.

What We Know about Campaign Work in Canada

Trying to understand what happens behind the scenes in an election campaign is like trying to open the proverbial black box. Campaigns are complicated operations hidden behind layers of secrecy. For decades, social science has been studying voter behaviour, so we know a lot about the statistical aspects of how voters make their decisions – which, in Canada, rely more on socialization, snippets of information about leaders, and deeply ingrained partisanship than we care to admit.[3] We can refer to inventories of descriptive accounts of what happened during almost all of Canada's federal election campaigns.[4] These time capsules transport us back to other eras to document the details of who did what. Occasionally, we are treated to a book authored by a practitioner who spills secrets, or an academic who reveals aspects of campaign operations. We can also draw on a variety of journal articles, book chapters, and news reports that profile campaign jobs.

Research in the previous edited collections in the UBC Press series Communication, Strategy, and Politics is part of the small body of Canadian literature about campaign work. What does it tell us? Primarily that Canadians should eschew American news media and Hollywood portrayals. American-style campaign operations do not exist in Canada. In their examination of the role of political strategists in Canada, two political scientists asserted that "there exists a media myth of hired gun, American-style political consultants who mastermind campaigns, but in reality we have an

insular, party-oriented, and small political strategist industry."[5] The election spending limits and infrequent elections in Canada mean that there is not much of an industry of campaign professionals in this country. The researchers observed that Canadian election campaigns are replete with party insiders, many of whom learn on the job and work their way up through the party. Partisans are on the lookout for strategic thinkers fiercely loyal to the party and its leader. There is a demand for campaign staff who have "expertise and experience in polling, branding, advertising, digital campaigning, or political strategy" and a particular need for astute digital strategists.[6] The researchers conclude that the talent pool is rather thin in Canada, a situation made worse by turnover and lack of institutional memory.

Yet at least one American-style import does have a profound effect on Canadian politics. The introduction of fixed-date election legislation has taken much of the guesswork out of when the next election will occur.[7] Previously, the prime minister asked the governor general to dissolve Parliament at a time likely to provide the governing party with optimal electoral advantage. The practice of snap elections at the federal level and governing to the constitutional limit of five years now seem to belong to a bygone era. The main exception, of course, is during a period of minority government when political competitiveness is intense and the prospect of Canadians being plunged into a sudden election is ever present.[8]

A deeply transformed communication environment has further implications for campaign work. Canadian political journalism is undergoing profound changes as digital actors join the ranks while the readership for print media declines.[9] Engaging with social media and digital metrics commands ever more attention from news editors and journalists. During an election campaign, they must contend for public attention with private citizens who have digital acumen and automated bots.[10] Unconventional political actors play the role of disrupter by uncovering embarrassing information

about politicians and by engaging in digital agitation.[11] Local candidates in Canada are active users of social media, with incumbents having much greater reach, yet most candidates fail to engage in direct dialogue with electors or to post information about themselves.[12] Likewise, political party leaders use social media foremost for broadcasting information in a one-way direction, ignoring the digital promise of two-way interaction with Canadians.[13] The party hierarchy's interest in social media resides in publicity and rapid response – but especially in garnering supporters' digital data to add to the party database.[14] Where advocacy groups are concerned, the use of digital technologies has muddied accountability because traditional engagements with members are replaced by digital relationships.[15] The smallest Canadian non-profits simply lack the resources to organize communication campaigns.[16]

Another observation stemming from the Communication, Strategy, and Politics series is how the permanent campaign intersects with election campaigning and how interconnected activities climax on election day. Leaders and political parties build their brands incrementally.[17] Often electoral success is the result of work over several federal electoral cycles, and there is interplay with party fortunes at the provincial level. Political strategists import strategies and tactics from other countries, but mostly they learn from observing successes and failures in the Canadian political system. Gradually, what used to be new and innovative becomes a normal practice for all of the mainstream parties.[18] Between elections, the party harnesses the resources available to its parliamentary caucus and staff, blurring parliamentary work and campaign work.[19] Behind the scenes, public servants patiently await the next government. Politics permeates when a new cabinet seeks to implement its agenda and as the Prime Minister's Office begins to place its political imprint on the machinery of government.[20] Within the public service, counterpressures exist as an impartial organization both resists and embraces partisan initiatives.[21] The permanent

campaign once again builds from a slow churn to a well-oiled operation in high gear when the writ of election is issued.

What We Have Learned about Campaign Work

The permanent campaign and the official campaign are academic distinctions. The Introduction of this book refers to Canadian political strategist John Duffy's observation that election campaigns are divided into the pre-writ period and the writ period.[22] Indeed, a number of chapters in this book reveal that practitioners organize their thinking according to this calendar-style division of labour. However, there are other ways of differentiating campaign work.

This book distinguishes between visible and invisible campaign activities. There is the election campaign itself, pregnant with the excitement, passion, and adrenalin that drive all of those directly involved in it to throw themselves into the task. They work tirelessly until the last door is knocked on, the final ad is aired, the remaining rally is organized, and all of the votes are tallied on election day.

There is a less obvious side to an election, one that takes place primarily outside the spotlight, in the offices of the government and its agencies, in the boardrooms of polling companies, and in the newsrooms of media organizations. Election preparedness is undoubtedly an ongoing process for both political parties and governments, but several chapters here reveal that interest groups and the media are not exempt from similar states of readiness. Long-term and extensive strategic preparations based on market research, consultations with various publics, and the use of data and analytics are common practices in every corner of the Canadian political environment, not just in partisan life. In short, the professional testimonies collected in this book seem to confirm the pervasiveness of the permanent campaign ethos in Canadian politics, in which election readiness extends far beyond the confines of the official campaign period. We organize its description into the following three broad themes.

Public Administration, Political Staffers, and
Electoral Administrators

We learn in the first section of the book that Ottawa's administrative machine moves into election-preparedness mode approximately six months to a year before a federal general campaign begins. The period prior to the drop of the writ propels electoral preparations in every ministry and agency, especially Elections Canada. In Chapter 1, Andrea Lawlor and Marc Mayrand explain how Canada's election administrator deploys its massive workforce across the country to ensure that eligible voters have access to ballots. They also remind readers of the various initiatives that Elections Canada and other government agencies undertake to safeguard the integrity of the election from rogue influences and disinformation tactics.

And what of the remaining political staff left to languish in ministers' offices while a campaign is under way? In Chapter 2, Paul Wilson and Michael McNair explain how the "caretaker convention" affects political staffers in cabinet offices. The vast majority of political staffers working for ministers migrate into their party's campaign workforce during an election, but some of those political operatives must stay behind and fulfill certain duties so that ministers can keep control of the government in the interim. Under the caretaker convention, ministers exercise self-restraint since, with no House of Commons present to grant confidence, opportunities to hold the governing party accountable are reduced. Yet ministers remain ministers during the election campaign, and they need support from their offices to keep their departments running. These political staffers are therefore an integral part of maintaining the political control of the government during an election.

As the campaign gets under way, the work of government administration carries on, and bureaucrats prepare for a smooth transition of power. In Chapter 3, Lori Turnbull and Donald Booth describe how the caretaker mode also guides public administrators in governance. Government business slows down, but high-ranking civil servants working in departments and central agencies supervise

teams of bureaucrats charged with preparing files on the policy priorities of the different parties. Doing so is an indication to the future government of their willingness to serve loyally as well as their capacity to provide informed advice rapidly to ministers selected for cabinet.

Election preparedness is a central mission of other federal agencies. In Chapter 4, Brooks DeCillia and Michel Cormier describe how the newly created Leaders' Debate Commission organized its first two national debates. In a few short months following its inception, the commission was able to bring in experts, parties, and media to develop and broadcast two debates: one in English and one in French. Approximately half of the Canadian population tuned in to see the leaders spar with one another as they tried to differentiate themselves, stand out, and persuade voters to their side. The authors recount the difficult process of determining participation in the debates, which ultimately resulted in a stage crowded by six leaders, a record in Canadian electoral history. Following their broadcast, David Johnston, the debates commissioner, ruminated that separating the debates – one with just the main contenders and another with all party leaders who qualify under the commission's criteria – is a suggestion worth considering.[23]

Implementing the Strategy: Tactics and Logistics at Play

Leaders' debates, like many other aspects of the campaign, are meticulously calibrated affairs. Some chapters describe how implementing carefully orchestrated battle plans demands high-level collaboration among those holding various campaign positions. Under the watchful eye of the national campaign director, teams responsible for platform design, fundraising, advertising, communication, the leader's tour, media relations, and voter mobilization must cooperate and find innovative, reactive, and efficient ways to carry out a cohesive, disciplined, yet somewhat flexible campaign plan.

We learn, however, that digital communication technologies put pressure on campaigns and can disrupt this discipline. David

McGrane and Anne McGrath highlight the strategic preoccupation with technology in Chapter 9, on the national campaign director. Even with careful planning, issues occur throughout an election that demand immediate responses, often in the absence of thoughtful preparation. For a national director, time is a rare resource; speedy consultation among the campaign team, along with information gleaned from social media monitoring, guides their public reactions and responses. Strategic decisions are increasingly shaped by interactions with digital technologies. This development will affect future campaigns, for there are few controls and regulations in place in Canada regarding digital communication.

Along a similar vein, in Chapter 11 Mireille Lalancette and Marie Della Mattia delve into the role of senior political adviser and the job of managing the image of the party leader. Team collaboration is especially key here since the leader's image is a crucial part of the overarching campaign strategy. The authors also comment on Jagmeet Singh's efforts and challenges as the first racialized party leader to contend for the office of prime minister. They indicate that who the leader is – and the values embraced and defended by that leader – drive campaign messaging, platform priorities, and voter identification and mobilization. Senior advisers must therefore keep the leader buoyed and energized. Shielding a party leader from the hustle and bustle of the day-to-day campaign has become standard practice, as has reacting to events in real time. Creating a safe environment around the leader is presented as a confidence-building tactic in which information is selectively presented to the leader on a must-know basis. Strategists insist that the leader's role in the campaign should be to meet with voters and explain the party's platform, not to micromanage the logistical minutiae of the tour. Furthermore, the imperative is to keep the leader's morale high; an energetic and positive leader has a trickle-down effect of maintaining engaged and positive troops of partisan volunteers.

Critics will contend that this protective approach can isolate leaders or place them in a somewhat misinformed electoral reality;

they can be left in the dark about how their campaigns are actually performing. However, positivity is key during a campaign. The accounts of strategists who have contributed to this volume imply that staffers, supporters, and reporters surround leaders during the campaigns. Yet a party leader's personal experience can be lonely. Protecting leaders from the usual vagaries of an election that can bounce them up and down in the polls goes some way toward improving the solitary nature of election campaigning.

Political Communication

Along with caretaking and collaboration, a third element of political management stands out: the centrality of communication in campaigns. Electoral campaigns, at their core, are communication campaigns. Sending partisan messages to specific groups of voters through social media platforms and online networks and communities, via both broadcast media and at voters' doors, is a critical undertaking. Chapters on national campaigning and communication indicate that electoral communication strategies are planned, deliberate, and tested. Parties engage in social media monitoring so that they have a grasp of what Canadians are talking about on their digital platforms. Obsessed with voter engagement, they run A/B testing of online ads or emails to uncover which issue, argument, font, or background colour is more likely to lead a voter to click on the distributed content. Yet elections are perilous, with best-laid plans requiring flexibility. Stéphanie Yates and John Chenery aptly point out in Chapter 10 that all of this careful attention to communication details can run up against an electoral system that encourages strategic voting.

In this volume, accounts of communication practices paint the picture of hyper-reactive individuals who face many high-stakes decisions every day of the campaign. They must navigate a hybrid, fast-paced communication environment that requires constant consultation and coordination; the capacity to respond with speed and agility is a job requirement. In an age of concurrent and

short-lived news cycles as well as instant access to information at everyone's fingertips, the most effective campaigns are often the most reactive ones.

This is true for political parties that run in elections, and it is equally true for news media, third parties, independent candidates, and polling aggregators. Media organizations want to inform Canadians about the campaign, but they also want to set the political agenda. As Colette Brin and Ryan MacDonald remind us in Chapter 5, the media's appetite for following the official leaders' tour is waning. The staged events are costly adventures that are tightly scripted and controlled, rarely offering added value for audiences, and they primarily serve partisan interests. Canadian news organizations are developing new forms of electoral coverage that focus more on citizens' interests, demands, and needs. Many of them commission public opinion polls that end up being data sources for unaffiliated polling aggregators that attract large followings. Chapter 6, by André Turcotte and Éric Grenier, demonstrates how these online instruments have become staples of political communication, often cited by the press and used by parties, in recent Canadian election cycles.

The final two chapters remind us that, even though campaigns are predominantly partisan affairs, other voices are hoping to command the attention of voters. Thomas Collombat and Magali Picard explain in Chapter 13 how third parties experience the campaign, not just with voters and political parties, but also with their members. Using the case of the Public Service Alliance of Canada – the largest union representing federal public employees – they reveal how it consults with its members through polls and assemblies in order to define its electoral strategy. This channel of communication remains open with members as the campaign unfolds. In Chapter 14, Tamara Small and Jane Philpott recount the latter's run as an independent candidate and the difficulties that she had to overcome in her campaign, including reaching out to voters without the benefit of a party electoral machine. Philpott's political

notoriety made her a high-profile candidate and helped her to run a well-financed and professional campaign in her Ontario riding of Markham–Stouffville. She lost her bid for re-election but ran an intensive and personal campaign during which she and her team of volunteers engaged with 75,000 voters. Philpott's journey might not be representative of all independent candidates, yet it does reveal the challenges that even a high-profile independent must confront in a political system that favours party candidates.

These chapters show that voters are the targets of numerous sources of persuasive communication during a campaign. Although parties can position themselves as the loudest voices in the mix, the media and third parties join the chorus of electoral communication.

There are other aspects of campaigns that might not be fully captured here, but they are worthy of future scrutiny. Data, for instance, are vital in campaigns. As chapters in this volume indicate, those directly involved in campaign operations often rely on information that has been collected and stored in party databases. Ensuring a successful rally means primarily packing a room with supporters. Campaigns turn to their databases to identify those partisans and invite them to the boisterous gathering. Jared Wesley and Renze Nauta show in Chapter 8 that party platform builders develop policies by using an array of information. Drawing from the principles of political marketing, platform builders use data to detect which voter groups are likely to support the party as well as which electoral promises can fulfill the needs of those groups.[24] In Chapter 7, Erin Crandall and Michael Roy reveal how fundraising is also a critical aspect of successful campaigning – knowing who has donated in the past, how much, and how to ask for more. Such information is attached to names in a party database.

A digital campaign strategy is an extension of what data contribute to election planning. It also recognizes that many citizens experience politics through digital communication channels. Campaigns have adopted and adapted to digital technologies – reaching

out to voters occurs on doorsteps as well as through online communities and networks.[25] Pushing out campaign messages or responding to attacks requires the assistance of social media influencers.[26] In Chapter 12, Vincent Raynauld and Dany Renauld insist that a party's advertising placement strategy requires a good knowledge of online platforms and who is using them. Ground operations benefit from mobile applications that enhance the ability to send information back to campaign headquarters. Canadian campaigns are now hybrid operations, involving both traditional offline and innovative online practices.[27] Online technologies offer parties different opportunities to engage with voters. Large-scale digital strategies that integrate advertising, voter outreach, fundraising, and field organizing have emerged at the epicentre of election planning to create a single user experience with the campaign. How digital strategy is developed and woven into Canadian campaigns is an area ripe for further exploration.

The rise of digital platforms as an integral part of campaigning has also introduced new threats to those who lead parties, who stand as candidates, or who take on roles within the campaign itself.[28] Securitizing campaigns from foreign interference by cyberthreat actors is an added layer of responsibility for the government, national security agencies, and political parties, though the last group are not compelled to do so by any law or regulation, nor do they have the same level of resources to devote to cybersecurity measures. Although there was minimal interference in the 2019 federal election, it is unknown how well prepared the parties were for cybersecurity threats.[29] Such threats can be targeted at systems and devices (e.g., servers, networks, platforms, and email accounts), at the spreading of disinformation, or at candidates themselves through coordinated trolling efforts. Securitizing campaigns has gone far beyond the need to protect the leader physically – notwithstanding Trudeau's need to wear a bulletproof vest at a campaign event in 2019. Today security centres on vulnerabilities exposed with digital technologies.

From Campaigning to Governing like a Campaign

This book has offered students and observers of Canadian politics something new. It is not just the perspective of one insider who tells the tale of a particular campaign. Nor is it focused on just one party or electoral role. Instead, this volume aims to detail aspects of elections in Canada that are common for governments, electoral administrators, and the political parties competing for power. The volume takes readers behind the scenes and attempts to shed light on rather opaque operations. The authors have tried to demystify the roles involved, outline the challenges that face operatives in these positions, and show how obstacles are conquered in the course of a campaign. They have also aimed to encourage more partnerships between academics and practitioners to reveal how things actually work – the whirring, steaming, whistling, and clanking of the campaign machine should not have a stupefying effect; instead, those noises should be seen as invitations to investigate their origins closely.

The book also demonstrates that elections in Canada, for the most part, are carefully managed affairs. Political management is a popular career choice in the United States, but it is downplayed in Canada. Limited election cycles are the primary reason, but there should be little doubt that careful handling of a party's campaign remains a serious undertaking. As noted elsewhere, the skills required to build and maintain a leader's image, galvanize social networks, respond rapidly to attacks, fundraise, and develop messages that resonate with citizens are all transferable to other sectors.[30] After the election, many campaign staffers apply their talents to the private and non-profit sectors, whereas others move into positions on either the government benches or the opposition benches. The point is that political management does not end with a campaign; the same thinking that drives strategic decision making in an election continues in government; political management matters because it is how parties govern today.

We anticipate the profiles and challenges inherent in each role described in this collection to be useful to Canadians as future Parliaments unfold, whether majority or minority, but minority situations heighten the requirement for campaign-like supervision. Fixed election dates are less reliable in a minority situation, and parties will be on a constant election footing. On average, minority governments tend to last two years, and replenishing their war chests is a preoccupation of all parties. Permanent campaigning is in full effect in every party.

Minority Parliaments also tend to increase partisanship inside the House of Commons, particularly between Liberals and Conservatives. Opposition leaders keep prime ministers on notice, and the rancour from the campaign itself spills into the theatre of the Commons. Attacks by one leader against another result in swift responses. In such a tense context, disciplined communication and leader image management are usually front and centre. A fixation on public opinion polls and aggregators is more acute. Any resources at the disposal of the governing party are employed to move its agenda forward so that policy achievements can be touted in the next election. A campaign-like atmosphere descends, like a heavy weight, over the Parliament of Canada.

Minority governments require a good deal of negotiation and cooperation. Collaboration among parties is as inevitable as acrimony. In many instances, partisan differences are set aside to accommodate the policy ideas of opposite members in order to secure the requisite number of votes to move legislation forward. Some effort at collaboration can be beneficial; the regional rifts that mark Canadian politics demand some reflection on how the parties can better bridge these differences. Whether the tactics that parties regularly use in campaigns can do this is an entirely different question but one worthy of posing. As this volume has shown, collaboration between academics and public sector practitioners might hold the promise of answering such questions.

Notes

1   Clarkson, *The Big Red Machine.*
2   Marland and Esselment, "Negotiating with Gatekeepers to Get Interviews with Politicians."
3   Gidengil et al., *Dominance and Decline.*
4   Among them, Marland and Giasson, *Canadian Election Analysis.*
5   Coletto and Gillies, "Political Strategists in Canada," 169.
6   Ibid., 177, 179.
7   Lagassé, "Institutional Change."
8   On political competitiveness, see Esselment, "Market Orientation in a Minority Government."
9   Paré and Delacourt, "The Canadian Parliamentary Press Gallery."
10 Chacon, Lawlor, and Giasson, "Hybridity and Mobility." See also contributions on the media in Marland and Giasson, *Canadian Election Analysis.*
11 McKelvey, Côté, and Raynauld, "Scandals and Screenshots."
12 Killin and Small, "The National Message, the Local Tour." See also their work in Marland and Giasson, *Canadian Election Analysis.*
13 Small, "Are We Friends Yet?"; Small, "The Not-So Social Network."
14 Patten, "Databases, Microtargeting, and the Permanent Campaign." See also his work in Marland and Giasson, *Canadian Election Analysis.*
15 Laforest, "Going Digital."
16 Grosenick, "Opportunities Missed." See also contributions about organized interests in Marland and Giasson, *Canadian Election Analysis.*
17 Wesley and Moyes, "Selling Social Democracy."
18 Marland, "Amateurs versus Professionals."
19 McGrane, "Election Preparation in the Federal NDP."
20 Esselment and Wilson, "Campaigning from the Centre."
21 Craft, "Governing on the Front Foot."
22 Duffy, *Fights of Our Lives.*
23 Wright, "Debates Commissioner David Johnston Suggests Separate Debate."
24 Patten, "Databases, Microtargeting, and the Permanent Campaign."
25 McKenna and Han, *Groundbreakers.*
26 Singer and Brooking, *Like War.*
27 Giasson, Le Bars, and Dubois, "Is Social Media Transforming Canadian Electioneering?"

28 Communications Security Establishment, "Cyberthreats to Canada's Democratic Processes."

29 On the level of interference, see Canadian Press, "So Far, Federal Election Has Had Little Misinformation or Disinformation."

30 Kinsella, *The War Room.*

Bibliography

Canadian Press. "So Far, Federal Election Has Had Little Misinformation or Disinformation: Researchers." *National Post,* 10 October 2019. https://nationalpost.com/news/politics/election-2019/election-has-been-mostly-free-of-mis-and-disinformation-research-shows.

Chacon, Geneviève, Andrea Lawlor, and Thierry Giasson. "Hybridity and Mobility: Media Elite Status on Political Twitter Hashtags." In *Political Elites in Canada: Power and Influence in Instantaneous Times,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Andrea Lawlor, 184–203. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018.

Clarkson, Stephen. *The Big Red Machine: How the Liberal Party Dominates Canadian Politics.* Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005.

Coletto, David, and Jamie Gillies. "Political Strategists in Canada." In *Political Elites in Canada: Power and Influence in Instantaneous Times,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Andrea Lawlor, 168–83. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018.

Communications Security Establishment. "Cyberthreats to Canada's Democratic Processes." 2019. https://cyber.gc.ca/en/guidance/cyber-threats-canadas-democratic-process.

Craft, Jonathan. "Governing on the Front Foot: Politicians, Civil Servants, and the Permanent Campaign in Canada." In *Permanent Campaigning in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Anna Lennox Esselment, 28–46. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2017.

Duffy, John. *Fights of Our Lives: Elections, Leadership, and the Making of Canada.* Toronto: HarperCollins, 2002.

Esselment, Anna. "Market Orientation in a Minority Government: The Challenges of Product Delivery." In *Political Marketing in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Jennifer Lees-Marshment, 123–38. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012.

Esselment, Anna Lennox, and Paul Wilson. "Campaigning from the Centre." In *Permanent Campaigning in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Anna Lennox Esselment, 222–40. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2017.

Giasson, Thierry, Gildas Le Bars, and Philippe Dubois. "Is Social Media Transforming Canadian Electioneering? Hybridity and Online Partisan Strategies in the 2012 Quebec Election." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 52, 2 (2019): 323–41.

Gidengil, Elisabeth, Neil Nevitte, André Blais, Joanna Everitt, and Patrick Fournier. *Dominance and Decline: Making Sense of Recent Canadian Elections.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012.

Grosenick, Gina C. "Opportunities Missed: Non-Profit Public Communication and Advocacy in Canada." In *Political Communication in Canada: Meet the Press and Tweet the Rest,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Tamara A. Small, 179–93. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.

Killin, Julie, and Tamara A. Small. "The National Message, the Local Tour: Candidates' Use of Twitter during the 2015 Canadian Election." In *Political Elites in Canada: Power and Influence in Instantaneous Times,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Andrea Lawlor, 223–42. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018.

Kinsella, Warren. *The War Room: Political Strategies for Business, NGOs, and Anyone Who Wants to Win.* Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2007.

Laforest, Rachel. "Going Digital: Non-Profit Organizations in a Transformed Media Environment." In *Political Elites in Canada: Power and Influence in Instantaneous Times,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Andrea Lawlor, 243–60. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018.

Lagassé, Philippe. "Institutional Change, Permanent Campaigning, and Canada's Fixed Election Date Law." In *Permanent Campaigning in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Anna Lennox Esselment, 167–83. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2017.

Marland, Alex. "Amateurs versus Professionals: The 1993 and 2006 Canadian Federal Elections." In *Political Marketing in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Jennifer Lees-Marshment, 59–75. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012.

Marland, Alex, and Anna Lennox Esselment. "Negotiating with Gatekeepers to Get Interviews with Politicians: Qualitative Research Recruitment in a Digital Media Environment." *Qualitative Research* 19, 6 (2018): 685–702.

Marland, Alex, and Thierry Giasson, eds. *Canadian Election Analysis: Communication, Strategy, and Democracy.* Vancouver: UBC Press, 2015. https://www.ubcpress.ca/canadianelectionanalysis2015.

McGrane, David. "Election Preparation in the Federal NDP: The Next Campaign Starts the Day after the Last One Ends." In *Permanent*

Campaigning in Canada, edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Anna Lennox Esselment, 145–64. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2017.

McKelvey, Fenwick, Marianne Côté, and Vincent Raynauld. "Scandals and Screenshots: Social Media Elites in Canadian Politics." In *Political Elites in Canada: Power and Influence in Instantaneous Times,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Andrea Lawlor, 204–22. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018.

McKenna, Elizabeth, and Hahrie Han. *Groundbreakers: How Obama's 2.2 Million Volunteers Transformed Campaigning in America.* New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Paré, Daniel J., and Susan Delacourt. "The Canadian Parliamentary Press Gallery: Still Relevant or Relic of Another Time?" In *Political Communication in Canada: Meet the Press and Tweet the Rest,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Tamara A. Small, 111–26.Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.

Patten, Steven. "Databases, Microtargeting, and the Permanent Campaign: A Threat to Democracy?" In *Permanent Campaigning in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Anna Lennox Esselment, 47–64. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2017.

Singer, P.W., and Emerson T. Brooking. *Like War: The Weaponization of Social Media.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2018.

Small, Tamara A. "Are We Friends Yet? Online Relationship Marketing by Political Parties." In *Political Marketing in Canada,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Jennifer Lees-Marshment, 193–208. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012.

–. "The Not-So Social Network: The Use of Twitter by Canada's Party Leaders." In *Political Communication in Canada: Meet the Press and Tweet the Rest,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Tamara A. Small, 92–108. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.

Wesley, Jared, and Mike Moyes. "Selling Social Democracy: Branding the Political Left in Canada." In *Political Communication in Canada: Meet the Press and Tweet the Rest,* edited by Alex Marland, Thierry Giasson, and Tamara A. Small, 74–91. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.

Wright, Teresa. "Debates Commissioner David Johnston Suggests Separate Debate for Main Contenders." CBC News, 12 November 2019. https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/debates-for-top-leaders-johnston-1.5356825.

Contributors to the Conclusion

ANNA LENNOX ESSELMENT
is an associate professor in the
Department of Political Science
at the University of Waterloo. Her
research interests include elections
and campaigns, political marketing,
and political parties. She is a coeditor
of *Permanent Campaigning in Canada*
(UBC Press, 2017).

THIERRY GIASSON
is a professor and the chair of the
Department of Political Science at
Université Laval. He is the director
of the Groupe de recherche en
communication politique. His research
focuses on political journalism, online
technologies, and political marketing.
He is the coeditor, with Alex Marland,
of the series Communication, Strategy,
and Politics at UBC Press.